

12. A Summary of ‘Teaching at Risk’: Teacher Mobility and Loss in Commonwealth Member States

Kimberly Ochs

‘Teachers’ interaction with learners is the axis on which educational quality turns.’

VSO, 2002, p.10

I. Introduction

The link between effectiveness in education and the quality of teachers is undisputed. Teachers play a pivotal role in the education system of any country, but the role of the teacher is even more relevant in developing countries and in areas where the educational environment is challenged and learning resources are limited.

Teacher loss is a phenomenon of many Commonwealth countries, both in industrialised and in developing nations, and can be classified into five broad categories, each of which must be addressed with careful consideration of the contextual issues of the education system:

- teacher loss to developed countries;
- teacher loss to neighbouring and other developing countries;
- teacher ‘drifting’;
- teacher disaffection and loss due to career change; and
- teacher attrition.

This research, supported by the Commonwealth Secretariat, was designed to:

- determine the extent of teacher loss, whether for reasons of recruitment by other countries, disaffection with the teaching environment leading to career change, or death due to the HIV/AIDS epidemic;
- understand the impact of teacher mobility and teacher loss; and

- investigate practices of teacher recruitment to inform the discussion of the Draft Protocol for the Recruitment of Commonwealth Teachers.

The second section explores the following questions related to the international context: What are the important contextual issues of supply and demand in the teaching profession throughout the Commonwealth? How has the Commonwealth addressed teacher mobility and teacher loss to date? What can be learned from the work on the Commonwealth Health Code of Practice? What might be applied to the establishment of a Protocol for the Recruitment of Commonwealth Teachers?

Section 3 reports results from a Pan-Commonwealth survey of teacher loss, and includes responses from 24 per cent of the Commonwealth member nations. In addition, personal experiences of teachers were shared in focus groups with teachers from Commonwealth member countries who had been recruited to work in the United Kingdom. Important and general themes were identified in the focus groups, although the scope of this study was limited to discussions with teachers in London.

The fourth section looks more closely at the teaching profession and the dimensions of teacher loss due to recruitment, teacher disaffection, career change, and HIV/AIDS.

Section 5 draws on findings from other reports and data related to teacher loss, and focuses more specifically on the issue of teacher recruitment.

The concluding section identifies key questions for further research and gaps in the findings of this study. In addition, the Annex has an overview of key educational facts for each of the Commonwealth nations, where provided.

2. The context of teacher loss and teacher mobility

2.1 What are the important contextual issues of supply and demand in the teaching profession throughout the Commonwealth?

According to UNESCO, teachers represent some 1.6 per cent of the world's population in the age group of 15–64-year-olds, and by some estimates the largest single group of professionals in the world. More than two-thirds of these teachers are employed in developing countries (Siniscalco, 2002, p.7). In examining the context of teacher loss in all countries in the Commonwealth, it is important to address the contextual issues that drive labour mobility among teachers. Although the effects may vary from country to country, all education systems are impacted by globalisation, GATS, and the universal initiative towards Education for All. HIV/AIDS must also be addressed, given its tremendous impact on labour in certain regions of the world, particularly Africa, and its impact on specific Commonwealth countries such as Uganda, Zambia, Botswana, The Gambia, South Africa and Swaziland among others.

2.2 Globalisation

As defined by Joseph Stiglitz, globalisation is 'the removal of barriers to free trade and the closer integration of national economies' (Stiglitz, 2002). Information about work,

opportunities and life experiences has become much more widely disseminated. This has encouraged the exchange of goods and services, and has inevitably influenced individual curiosity and aspirations. According to Harvard University professor Dani Rodrik, 'even a marginal liberalisation of international labour flows would create gains for the world economy' far greater than prospective gains from trade negotiations' (Fidler and Marsh, 2002, p.9). It is estimated that the benefit to workers in poorer countries would yield \$200bn for the developing world, with the benefits going into workers' pockets.

One of the strategies used by developed countries to adapt to and survive in the new global economy is to improve the education system. Investment in the educational infrastructure, teacher training, and the creation of incentives to lure people to the teaching profession are common practice in many countries. School systems need good talent in the classrooms and in managerial roles to prepare pupils effectively. International studies, such as the OECD PISA study, have helped to encourage the cross-national comparison of education systems and student achievement. Such discourse is frequently related to economic prosperity, and may continue to fuel competition and the notion that teachers are crucial to train pupils and build long-term economic capacity.

2.3 GATS and teacher mobility

The General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS) is the first multilateral agreement to provide legally enforceable rights to trade in all services, including cultural ones. It recognises four modes of service delivery:

- Mode 1: *Cross-border supply* of services supplied from one country to another (e.g. banking or architectural services provided through telecommunications or mail);
- Mode 2: *Consumption abroad* by consumers or firms using a service in another country (e.g. tourism or aircraft maintenance work);
- Mode 3: *Commercial presence* of a foreign company setting up subsidiaries to provide services in another country (e.g. insurance companies or hotel chains); and
- Mode 4: *Presence of natural persons* who travel from their own country to supply services in another (e.g. auditors, physicians, executive officers of multinational corporations, or teachers).

However, there is an important distinction to be made between liberalising the permanent movement of labour versus the temporary movement of labour. It is also a fine distinction to bring to the discussion teacher loss, which leads this author to ask 'Does the mobility of teachers and experience abroad help them to develop skills which can be brought home, or does mobility merely drain skills and create problems of inadequate human resources?'

The economic principle behind Mode 4 of GATS is that larger differences in the prices of factors of production in international trade bring larger potential gains from

opening up international trade. More specifically, the principle is that if medium and less-skilled workers, who are relatively abundant in developing countries, move and provide their services in developed countries, then potentially larger returns would be available. A team of economists led by L. Alan Winters of the University of Sussex, using an equilibrium model, suggest that if quotas were increased by an amount equal to 3 per cent of developed countries' labour forces, there would be an increase in world welfare of \$US156 billion per year (Winters et al, 2002). The team argues that as the population's age and the average levels of training and education rise in developed countries, they will face a growing scarcity of less skilled labour. They advocate a Temporary Movement of Natural Persons (TMNP) to provide a strong commonality of interest between developing and developed countries (Winters et al, 2002).

Mobility among teachers, and labour in general, is not new. In developing countries, migration became more profound following independence in response to political turmoil, economic hardships, and repressive dictatorships. For others, mobility brings the opportunity of more qualifications and, in theory, more career stability. In the Caribbean region, 'microstate educators are themselves invariably trained abroad in the metropolis and usually return home imbued with the theory and content of courses which they generally seek to duplicate or reproduce, laced with the glamour accorded to international credentials' (Fentey, 2001, pp.245-56).

As the director of the Refugee Study Centre at Oxford University, Stephen Castles, points out, migration has been associated historically with periods of high growth in destination countries: 1875-1914, the 1960s and 1990s. Today, in most countries, there is a shortage of teachers. Recruitment, however, is now being done in a more organised way by governments, targeting more experienced teachers with special skills in return for 'better' compensation. Teachers from Guyana are going to Botswana and The Bahamas where remuneration is more lucrative (Guyana Chronicle Online). Teachers from India are moving to the United States, Canada and the UK.

Recruitment agencies have identified 'education' as a high-growth area in the recruitment business. The issue of teacher loss, the ramifications in the source country, and the suitability of skill transfers across different countries must be considered carefully. An important finding of this study is that when careful consideration is not given to the needs of the students, schools and teachers, recruited individuals return home, incurring greater costs and lost revenue to the recruitment firms.

2.4 'Education for All'

A worldwide commitment to 'Education for All' was first made in 1990 in Jomtien, Thailand and reconfirmed in Dakar, Senegal at the World Forum on Education of 2000. These commitments are outlined below. According to Education International, an estimated five million primary teachers will be needed to deliver the commitment on primary education in Africa alone. According to UNESCO/ILO, the population of official primary school age children has grown by more than 16 per cent in the African region south of the Sahara and 3.5 per cent in the Caribbean and Latin American

regions, with an average of 9 per cent in developing countries (Siniscalco, 2002, p.7). Hence, issues around the performance of teachers, retention, training and recruitment will become very important matters of concern. The Dakar Framework for Action, issued in 2000, mentioned specifically the 'pre-eminent role' of teachers in providing quality basic education, and that this 'must entail measures to respect teachers' union rights and professional freedoms and improve their working conditions and status, notably in respect of their recruitment, initial and in-service training, remuneration and career development possibilities, as well as to allow teachers to fulfil their aspirations, social obligations and ethical responsibilities. However, fears are emerging that the 2002/03 World Bank plan has the potential to undermine governments' ability to formulate rational, appropriate national policy in this vital sphere. For example, the World Bank Action plan recommends capping teacher salaries as a percentage of per capital GDP.

As Voluntary Service Overseas (VSO) discusses in its 2002 report *What makes teachers tick?*, donors are now moving away from the paradigm of the 1980s and 1990s, providing project-based interventions and regarding education as an arena for cost-reduction (VSO, 2002). VSO also points out that the issue of access to education overshadows the issue of quality education. Recruiting new teachers will help to mitigate the issue of access, but the importance of initial training, along with on-going training and experience, must also be addressed as it relates to the quality of education received so that it is relevant to the local needs of students and the community (VSO, 2002).

2.5 HIV/AIDS

It is estimated that by the end of 2001 there were over forty million people infected by HIV/AIDS. About one-third of the people living with HIV in the world are between 15 and 24. It is estimated that about 36 per cent of Botswana's 15-49 year olds live with

Box 12.1. 'Education for All' commitments - Dakar 2000

- Expand improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children
- Ensure that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities have access to and complete free and compulsory primary education of good quality.
- Ensure that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skills programmes.
- Achieve a 50 per cent improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for all adults.
- Eliminate gender disparities in primary and secondary education in 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls' full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.
- Improve all aspects of the quality of education and ensure excellence of all so that recognised and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.

the disease while Lesotho, Swaziland and Zimbabwe, all members of the Commonwealth, have 25 per cent of their population in this same age group similarly afflicted (de Rebello, 2002). These are merely estimates, as the collection of statistics on HIV/AIDS is extremely problematic. In areas of the world where testing is limited, it is difficult to verify who are infected with HIV and in many countries HIV/AIDS is not recognised as a cause of death. Rather, an affiliated illness might be reported as the cause of death, which obscures our understanding of the epidemic. HIV/AIDS has the potential to affect education, throughout the world, in several ways, as set out in the following framework by Michael Kelly (1999) of the University of Zambia, within the Commonwealth. HIV/AIDS affects:

- demand for education;
- supply of education;
- availability of resources for education;
- potential clientele for education;
- process of education;
- content of education;
- role of education;
- organisation of the school;
- planning and management of the education system; and
- donor support for education.

2.6 The context of small states

Thirty-two of the countries in the Commonwealth are classified as small states - those with a population of less than 1.5 million. The depletion of the human resource in education has the greatest immediate and prolonged impact on small states. This includes the territories in the Caribbean that are frequently targeted today as sources for teacher recruitment. Colin Brock (1988, pp.167-79) described small states in some instances as relatively remote, dependent and constrained. Mark Bray (1992) identified six factors that pose problems and challenges for small states for planning, developing and managing their systems. These are:

- (1) Resource capacity: Many small states lack adequate water supplies and mineral resources, or the qualified human resources to meet their needs.
- (2) Natural disaster: Hurricanes, volcanoes, earthquakes and cyclones have devastated island economies, such as Antigua.
- (3) Foreign capital: Many small developing states rely on external grants and loans, and most of their available capital is owned by foreign multi-national corporations.

- (4) Transport and communications: Small developing countries pay more for transportation since they do not generate sufficient volume. There are often problems generated by terrain, multi-island management, and connecting transport links.
- (5) Domestic and external markets: Small country economies are dependent on foreign trade.
- (6) Expenditure on administration: The achievement of an economy of scale is rarely possible.

In discussing the development of educational personnel, Charles Farrugia acknowledges factors such as a fragile infrastructure, limited resources, and a volatile economic base. However, an advantage of a small population is a wide network of personal relationships.

As Fentey Scott found in his study of head teachers, despite generous spending on educational services in the eastern Caribbean – Anguilla, Antigua, the British Virgin Islands, Dominica, Grenada and the Grenadines – it is difficult to provide for adequate training of head teachers. Most of the allocated funds go towards the expansion needs of primary and secondary level education, and to the training of primary teachers. Unlike Barbados, Trinidad and Tobago, and Jamaica, these islands do not have sufficient resources to send their heads to be trained in Barbados, which is the campus more convenient to them geographically (Scott, 2001, pp.245–56).

2.7 How has the Commonwealth addressed this issue to date?

The Draft Protocol for the Recruitment of Commonwealth Teachers (2003) emerged after a series of initiatives by Commonwealth member nations to take a holistic approach to addressing the global problem of teacher loss and a shortage of teachers.

On 14 June, 2001, a joint statement of co-operation on education and training between the government of the UK and the government of South Africa was issued to address teacher recruitment, higher education, further education and training, recognition of qualifications, and school twinning. It was signed by the then UK Secretary of State for Education and Skills Estelle Morris (MP) and Professor Kadar Asmal, Minister of Education for the Government of the Republic of South Africa. This agreement was important in setting a precedent for key areas that are also addressed in the Draft Protocol for The Recruitment of Commonwealth Teachers.

In May 2002, following a major upsurge in the recruitment of Caribbean teachers (from Barbados, Guyana, Jamaica and Trinidad) by North America and the United Kingdom, the then Minister of Education of Jamaica, Hon. Burchell Whiteman, requested the assistance of the Commonwealth Secretariat to address the problem of teacher recruitment in the Caribbean.

On 2 July, 2002, the Ministers of Education of the Commonwealth Caribbean held a meeting at the Savannah Hotel in Barbados, including representatives from Barbados, Jamaica, Grenada, St. Lucia, Cayman Islands, Trinidad and Tobago, Antigua and Barbuda

and Guyana. The purpose of the meeting was to develop a uniform approach to deal with the issue of the recruitment of teachers from the Caribbean by developed countries, particularly the United States (New York) and the UK. Not all of the Caribbean islands have yet been affected by the migration of teachers, but as Jamaican Minister Whiteman stated, the problem would eventually touch each of the islands.

Issues addressed included:

- 'Brain Drain' – this is of concern particularly in specialised areas such as mathematics and science, where the local area needs to benefit from local talent in the region.
- Teachers who migrated to the US and the UK still remained Caribbean nationals. Minister Whiteman commented that their policies and systems should address matters such as job security.

Between August 2002 and February 2003, as requested in the Savannah Accord, meetings were held with the High Commissioners and a consultant was contracted to prepare the draft protocol. In September, all 54 Commonwealth member nations were surveyed to report data on teacher loss. In March 2003, the first draft of the protocol was reviewed at a meeting in the Seychelles and it was agreed that the protocol should go forward to the 15th Conference of Commonwealth Education Ministers (15CCEM). In June 2003, the draft Protocol was circulated to all members of the Commonwealth. Between July and September, this study was conducted to analyse the data gathered on teacher loss in the Commonwealth member states and to understand the dimensions of this issue in preparation for a planned discussion of a code of practice for the international recruitment of teachers, similar to the initiative championed by the health section with regard to the recruitment of health care workers.

3. Findings of the study 'Teaching at Risk in the Commonwealth'

This study was designed to satisfy two action items that were specified in the Savannah Accord:

- Conduct national research to determine the extent of teacher loss and the short and long-term impact on each country's education system and provide the outcomes of this national research to the Commonwealth Secretariat.
- Support the conduct of a Pan-Commonwealth study of the problem.

Both qualitative and quantitative research strategies were used to achieve these objectives. On 30 September, 2002, a survey was sent out to all 54 Ministers of Education within the Commonwealth, along with a copy of the report of the meeting of Ministers of Education of the Commonwealth Caribbean held in July 2002 and of the Savannah Accord. Countries were asked to provide the following data:

- total numbers in teaching force (2001–2): males, females and total;
- percentage turnover of teachers in years 2000, 2001, and 2002; and

- teacher loss in numbers due to overseas recruitment, career change, death and retirement in the years 2000, 2001, and 2002.

The analysis includes data from 13 countries and territories. Responses were received from twelve countries and territories: Australia, Bahamas, Barbados, Canada, Jamaica, Malaysia, Montserrat (UK), New Zealand, St. Lucia, Seychelles, Swaziland, and Zambia. Canada responded to the request for information but was not able to provide data. Data for the United Kingdom were incorporated into the study and are publicly available on the website of the Department for Education and Skills and in various Office of Standards in Education (Ofsted) reports.

Focus groups were also conducted with teachers who had been recruited from developing Commonwealth countries to teach in schools in London. Due to time constraints and the feasibility of the study, in-person focus groups were only conducted in London, but included a wide sampling of teachers from different Commonwealth countries to offer insights and reflections about their career aspirations, potential disaffection with teaching in their home countries, and general commentary on the state of the education system and teaching profession in their home countries. The first of these focus groups met on 11 August at the offices of the National Union of Teachers in London. Eight Jamaican qualified teachers (five men and three women) attended the group. Their median age was 28 and they had a median of five years teaching experience in Jamaica. The second focus group met on 15 September at Hurlingham and Chelsea School in Fulham, South London and included eight teachers from South Africa, Australia, India, Canada, Ghana, and Jamaica.

3.1 Survey results from Commonwealth member nations

Whilst accepting that teacher loss and turnover are not identical, as some teachers may leave the system for a time and return later, the summary table reporting the size of the teaching force and teaching turnover is presented in Table 12.1. The data provided by the ministries of education that responded to the survey is presented with the understanding that such data is not easy to capture, but is nonetheless the most accurate that member countries have been able to provide for this study.

The highest reported turnover rate among those surveyed was in Australia. In 2001, the reported turnover rate in Australian secondary schools was more than 16 per cent. For the same year, the total turnover rate for primary and secondary schools was 14.33 per cent. Since data are not available for the UK for the year 2001, and 'the information requested is collected neither by governments nor by teacher federations' in Canada, further research would need to be conducted to make a definitive comparison (Cappon, 2002). In the findings, a distinction is made among the types of teacher loss, classifying them according to: disaffection/ career change, recruitment to developing countries, recruitment to developed countries, retirement, death, HIV/AIDS, and teacher 'drifting'. Quantitative information was not available for all respondent countries which delineated these distinctions, but the focus group discussions provided valuable information to further understanding of this situation.

Over half of the respondents did not directly answer the questions. Some provided data for 1999, and additional information such as the impact of teacher loss on certain subjects and the gender composition of teachers. This information is included in the individual country summaries, along with relevant commentary from the Savannah Meeting of education ministers, and relevant information gathered from secondary sources where available.

3.1.1 Australia

The Australian Education Union has reported that there are already shortages in regional schools and specific subject areas such as science and technical studies, but by 2005, there will be a national shortfall of 5,000 teachers (Goodfellow, 2003). About 200,000 full-time equivalent teachers were employed in schools in 1990.

Australia has also reported a tremendous loss in the teaching profession, as supported by these research findings. As stated in a recent document from the Australian Education Union: 'Across Australia there is a growing teacher shortage. Unless this issue is addressed now with a comprehensive and national approach, we will have more classrooms without teachers and a decline in the standard of the teaching profession. The

Table 12.1. Number of teachers working and percentage turnover for Commonwealth countries, 1999-2002

Country	Total population	Teaching force (2001-2002)			Percentage turnover			
		Male	Female	Total	1999	2000	2001	2002
Australia *	19,138,000	77,137	172,492	249,629	n/a	n/a	13.03	n/a
Australia **					n/a	n/a	16.15	n/a
Bahamas	304,000	969	3,384	4,353	3.70	4.10	5.50	n/a
Barbados	267,000	906	1,965	2,871	2.58	1.78	3.52	n/a
Canada	30,007,094	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Jamaica	2,576,000	4,825	16,807	21,632	5.50	2.90	9.80	n/a
Malaysia	22,218,000	99,298	180,689	279,987	n/a	0.89	1.10	1.75
Montserrat (UK)	8,437	11	48	59	n/a	5.00	8.00	3.00
New Zealand	3,855,400	13,185	33,023	46,208	11.60	12.50	12.90	12.80
Seychelles	80,000	450	1,165	1,615	n/a	7.10	5.80	6.00
St Lucia*	148,000	485	1,781	2,266	6.10	6.00	4.40	n/a
St Lucia**					10.50	8.80	7.20	n/a
Swaziland	925,000	3,913	6,983	10,896	n/a	5.50	3.60	12
United Kingdom	58,789,194			438,800	14.30	15.30	n/a	n/a
Zambia	10,421,000	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	3.10	3.40	2.50

*primary

**secondary

solution of looking overseas to recruit is no longer possible as the shortage is a world-wide problem' (AEU, no date). The union explains teacher loss by increased disaffection among teachers who have left the job early due to the increased complexity and difficulty of the job, lack of career progression, and the loss of support from employers. Real wage value for teachers has declined over these years, leaving teachers paid less than people in professions with similar training requirements. In addition, there is great concern about the retirement of teachers. Today, the average age of an Australian teacher is 43 and it is projected that the nation faces a potential loss of 30,000 teachers in the next decade (Hutchinson, 2003).

An Australian member of one of the focus groups provided additional insights into the issue of teacher migration. According to him, it was common practice for university graduates to seek a two-year holiday visa to go and explore, travel, and seek short-term or long-term employment opportunities in conjunction with teaching. In this opinion, however, this was a more common practice among younger teachers. A work permit and experience abroad was not thought to significantly impact a teacher's salary, or help a teacher get a better job, because the experience was itself so common.

3.1.2 Bahamas

The Bahamas are a small island chain close to Cuba with a population of 304,000 and where over 90 per cent of people live in urban areas. Education in the Bahamas is free and compulsory from age five to sixteen. The Bahamas reported on the absolute numbers of teachers in schools, providing a breakdown between teachers in government schools and teachers in private schools.

Data were provided on percentage of absolute turnover, but no data were provided that explained the causes for turnover, as requested.

3.1.3 Barbados

Barbados is the most easterly of the islands group of the Caribbean, with a population of only 267,000. Barbados provided information on the total size of the teaching force. As of June 2002, there were 2,871 teachers in Barbados, 68 per cent of whom were female and 32 per cent were male. Between 1999 and 2001, there was a slight increase in the number of teachers who left the system, from 2.58 per cent in 1999 to 3.52 per cent in 2001. Barbados also reported very useful data on where leaving teachers went to work, and on the number of teachers in each of these locations:

Subject areas that experienced losses were: Business, English, General Studies, History, Fine Arts and Foreign Language. M.A. Bryan, responding for the Permanent Secretary

	<i>Male</i>	<i>Female</i>	<i>Total</i>
Teachers in government schools	632	2404	3036
Teachers in private schools	337	980	1317

1999	3 - Cayman Islands 1 - Botswana 1 - British Virgin Islands
2000	5 - Cayman Islands 1 - British Virgin Islands 1 - Saba 1- Bermuda
2001	3 - Cayman Islands 22 - New York

added, 'Generally, the Ministry has not been supporting requests from overseas recruiters where the teacher is assigned to subject areas such as Mathematics, Sciences (Chemistry, Biology, Physics), Geography and Special Education and other priority areas as may be determined from time to time'.

In Barbados and Jamaica in 2001, the largest number of teachers who were recruited went to New York State, closely followed by the UK. Although the purpose of this report is to address the issue within the Commonwealth, it is clearly a global issue. Additional data provided on the impact on subject areas, particularly teacher loss in the sciences, provided insight as to important areas for human resource development.

3.1.4 Canada

Canada responded to the request for information, but did not provide any data. Paul Cappon (2002), Director General of the Council of Ministers of Education, Canada, stated, 'It is with regret that I must inform you that Canada is unable to complete the questionnaire, since the information requested is collected neither by governments nor by teacher federations. I am aware of the importance of gathering this kind of data for Commonwealth countries, but unfortunately at this time Canada is unable to provide a report'.

Similar to Australia, Canada is particularly concerned about the demographics of the 'baby boom' generation and the retirement of teachers. For example, Ontario anticipates that it will need 3,000 secondary school mathematics and science teachers in the next ten years to replace those expected to retire. It expects to hire 9,000 - 10,000 teachers per year for the next seven years (Canada Newswire, 2003).

3.1.5 Jamaica

Jamaica has a longstanding tradition of losing its teachers to other islands in the Caribbean, such as The Bahamas, Turks and Caicos Islands, Cayman and the Virgin Islands, and in more recent times to African countries such as Botswana and Ghana (PARU, 2002). Today, there is much more concern about recruitment to the US and to the UK, and as of March 2002 it was reported that more than 600 Jamaican teachers

had gone to work in US and English schools (*Daily Mail*, 2002). With a total population of 2,576,000, this is of great concern to Jamaica. Recruitment firms are, of course, targeting the most talented and experienced teachers, which is leading to even greater 'brain drain'. According to a report compiled by the Policy Analysis and Research unit, in reference to one cohort of recruits, 'Over 40 per cent of the 337 recruits [in one year] had between five and ten years' teaching experience while 30 per cent has between 10 and 20 years. Of the 116 primary school teachers, 57 per cent had over 10 years experience' (PARU, 2002).

In response to the survey for this study, Jamaica also reported on the total size of the teaching force at early childhood, primary and secondary levels by age and gender. The majority of teachers are over 30, and 46.5 per cent are over 40 years of age, indicating that the issue of retirement will become a concern in the very near future.

In addition, Jamaica reported (see Table 12.3) results on the number of teachers by subject area who left the system in 2001 in all regions, except region one.

Table 12.2. Teachers in Jamaica, by age and gender

Age	Male	Female	Total	%
18-20	36	120	156	0.7
21-30	1,666	4,837	6,503	30.0
31-40	1,162	3,753	4,915	22.7
41-50	1,328	5,340	6,668	30.8
51-60	598	2,650	3,248	15.0
61 and over	20	85	105	0.5
Missing age	15	22	37	0.2
Early childhood to secondary level	4,825	16,807	21,632	99.0

Table 12.3. Teachers leaving the system in Jamaica, by subject area

English	22.0%
History / social studies	14.4%
Science	12.8%
Mathematics	10.4%
Primary teachers	10.4%
Business education	8.8%
Industrial art	4.4%
Art & craft	3.6%
Home economics	2.4%
Agriculture	2.4%

New York state has targeted specifically to hire teachers from Jamaica. In 2001, 51 per cent of the international teacher recruits in New York came from Jamaica. In the report from the Policy Analysis and Research Unit, it was stated that:

Many teachers in Jamaica may love their country and want to contribute to its development, but their personal situation forces them to work in the US and UK schools, which should result in an improved standard of living for them. The basic gross salary for a diploma trained teacher starts from J\$406,977 to J\$621,167 for a master teacher. In comparison, in 2001, teachers recruited by VIF, would have received an annual salary of between US\$26,000 – 35,000 and those recruited by the NY Board of Education, a minimum salary of US\$31,910 [J\$1,691,230]. Presently, the Jamaican dollar is being traded at J\$53 to US\$1 and it takes over J\$87 to buy one UK pound.

There was a significant increase in turnover among Jamaican teachers from 2.9 per cent in 2000 to 9.8 per cent in 2001. The Jamaican government has since then engaged in discussions with NY State to limit the number of recruits, but data were not available for 2002.

3.1.6 Malaysia

As reflected in the data, the total size of the teaching force increased from 267,758 to 279,987 between 2000 and 2002. However, the percentage turnover had also increased sharply, from 0.89 per cent in 2000 to 1.75 per cent in 2002. Malaysia provided figures for teacher loss due to optional retirement, resignation and compulsory retirement, but was unable to provide statistics indicating death. Shahrol Padiman, in a letter of response from the Educational Planning and Research Division commented, 'Regretfully, we are not able to identify the reasons why teachers in Malaysia resigned and chose optional retirement as they are not required to state specific reasons other than to cite 'personal reasons' for leaving the profession. Likewise, statistics indicating death among teachers are also not available as the data is not reported to our ministry'.

3.1.7 Monserrat (UK)

Monserrat is an island in the Caribbean and a protectorate of the UK, with a very small population of just over 8,000 people (2002) of which 59 are teachers. Much of the island was devastated and destroyed by a volcano in July 1995 which has continued to emit pyroplastic flows as recently as 2003. The population size – hence the teaching force – varies and has been as high as 12,000 (June 1995) and as low as 3,000 (1997) as the volcano activity continues. The country is largely engaged in rebuilding its infrastructure. In 2000, a total of two teachers left for a career change and one left for retirement. In 2001, one teacher left to go overseas and three retired. Most recently, in 2003, one teacher retired.

3.1.8 New Zealand

New Zealand responded by providing absolute numbers for teachers as of March 2002, and a breakdown of teacher loss by designation and school type for the May to May

academic years ending in 1999, 2000, and 2001. Figures were startling, and indicated total attrition rates escalating from 11.6 per cent in 1999 up to 12.8 per cent in 2002. These numbers reflected teacher loss in primary, secondary, special, composite and correspondence schools. In addition, New Zealand provided information on losses among school principals (headteachers) and management. Although the trends were the same, the absolute percentages of teacher loss were lower.

3.1.9 Seychelles

Seychelles provided all of the information required. Data indicated a total of 1,615 teachers in the teaching force in 2001–2 (72 per cent female, 28 per cent males), and a decline in turnover from 7.1 per cent in 2000 to 6.0 per cent in 2002.

In absolute numbers, the greatest loss of teachers was due to career change (62 teachers), followed by overseas recruitment (20 teachers) in 2002. The absolute number of teachers who left due to career change has changed very little, whereas there was a drastic drop in the overseas recruitment between the years 2000 (43 teachers recruited) and 2003 (20 teachers recruited).

3.1.10 St Lucia

St Lucia was able to provide aggregate information on teacher loss, and also provided a breakdown of teaching force by gender and school level (2001/02) and teaching force by age for primary and secondary schools (2002). In total, 76 per cent of their teachers are female. However, the gender distribution is radically different across the school levels. 100 per cent of the primary school teachers are female, but the participation of men gradually increases with the school level, to the point where men make up 45 per cent of the teaching force in tertiary institutions. The age range of teachers is fairly evenly distributed between the ages of 20 and 50.

St Lucia was unable to provide reasons for teacher loss. As the respondent stated, ‘All teachers request study leave without pay to pursue studies. No teacher thus far has indicated that the reason for requesting leave is for overseas recruitment’. St Lucia claims to have experienced no impact on teacher loss by subject. ‘It has been noted by the Human Resources Management department that all teachers on their records have

Table 12.4. New Zealand teacher loss rates by designation and school type, May to May

% Loss	1998/99			1999/00			2000/01			2001/02		
	P	S	T	P	S	T	P	S	T	P	S	T
Principal	6.0	6.5	6.1	6.8	9.5	7.2	8.1	8.1	8.1	8.1	12.3	8.7
Management	6.4	7.4	7.1	6.6	7.0	6.9	7.2	7.6	7.5	8.1	8.9	8.6
Teacher	11.2	12.3	11.6	12.4	12.7	12.5	12.7	13.1	12.9	12.1	14.0	12.8
Total	9.4	9.3	9.4	9.9	9.4	9.8	10.4	9.9	10.2	10.2	11.1	10.6

P= Primary; S= Secondary; T= Total

Table 12.5. Teachers in St Lucia, by gender and teaching level

<i>School level</i>	<i>Male</i>	<i>%</i>	<i>Female</i>	<i>%</i>	<i>Total</i>
Pre-school	0	0	362	100	362
Primary	170	16	892	84	1062
Secondary	256	36	454	64	710
Tertiary	59	45	73	55	132
Total	485		1781		2266

Table 12.6. Teachers in St Lucia, by age group

<i>Age group</i>	<i># of teachers</i>
20 years or less	10
>20 and <=30	524
>30 and <=40	503
>40 and <=50	559
>50	176
Total	1,772

left at the end of the school years. Thus no loss by subject is experienced. Replacements are normally found for the next school year.' This question was interpreted slightly differently by the St Lucian representative than it had been by other respondents.

3.1.11 Swaziland

There are 10,896 teachers in Swaziland. 64 per cent of these teachers (6,983) are female, and 36 per cent (3,913) are male. There has been a large increase in the percentage of turnover, from 5.5 per cent in 2000 to 12 per cent in 2002. Nearly four times as many teachers were lost due to death or retirement in 2002 than to career change. A very likely explanation for this reason is the impact of HIV/AIDS, but more information would need to be gathered to confirm this hypothesis. Also, it is difficult to say if sick teachers retired in anticipation of death from HIV/AIDS. In general, it is difficult to capture accurate data on HIV/AIDS-related death, particularly in countries which do not report HIV/AIDS as an actual cause of death, but instead report the symptomatic illnesses.

3.1.12 United Kingdom

As of 22 May, 2002, there were 4,480 vacancies for nursery, primary, secondary and special schools in England. According to Joy Nichols, Director of Nichols Recruitment Agency, conservative estimates state a shortage of 2,500 teachers for London schools, and possibly up to 40,000 nationally. It is anticipated that there will be a shortage of teachers with experience in the UK, since 60 per cent of current teachers are over 40.

The current rate of retirement and premature retirement in the UK is 6,100 per year, which is expected to rise to over 14,000 per year within five years (Hutchings et. al., 2002, p.182-3).

According to an Ofsted report, 'In primary schools inspected during 2001/02, an average of 32 per cent of teaching staff had left during the previous two years, while for secondary schools the equivalent figure was 30 per cent. The greatest turnover of teachers in primary and secondary schools was in inner and outer London LEAs, where about 40 per cent of teachers changed. High staff turnover is often found in schools where a high proportion of pupils are entitled to free school meals. Peter Butler, president of the National Association of Schoolmasters/Union of Women Teachers (NASUWT) believes that the shortage of teachers in Britain has been caused by inadequate pay, poor working conditions, increased workload, and violent and disruptive pupils. As Ofsted acknowledged, 'strategies to support the recruitment of teachers are more firmly established than those designed to retain teachers. Most of the LEAs surveyed have suitable induction programmes and other arrangements for newly qualified teachers and new headteachers. Few, however, have clear policies for quality assurance through providing teachers with a coherent set of programmes to extend teachers' and headteachers' professional knowledge and skills. The best LEAs recognise that there is a need to develop an attractive career package for school staff.'

In an effort to manage staffing shortages, many schools recruit temporary (supply) teachers. In primary schools in England, about 7 per cent of the teachers were on temporary contracts at the time they were inspected; the corresponding figure in secondary schools was 5 per cent. In both primary and secondary schools, the greatest proportion of temporary teachers was in inner and outer London LEAs: 10 per cent in London primary schools and 7 per cent in London secondary schools. 'A third of LEAs surveyed during the year have been actively pursuing the recruitment of overseas teachers. In London, in particular, the recruitment of overseas teachers has been vital to fill teacher vacancies. This has brought problems as well as solutions. Such teachers are not usually familiar with the National Curriculum or the national strategies, and some have significant problems with classroom management and control. Some LEAs do actively follow up schools unable to meet the training and induction needs of these teachers. In one of these LEAs, approximately one primary teacher in every six had been trained overseas.'(GoUK, 2002) According to Mr. Butler, if it had not been for teachers from Australia, New Zealand and South Africa, schools in London would have faced 'wholesale' closure (Omar, 2002).

Joy Nichols, director of Nichols Employment Agency, cites some additional reasons why the teaching profession is a less attractive profession in the UK: long and anti-social working hours, increase in administration work, high transportation costs, an erosion of authority in the classroom, limited access to affordable accommodation, and poor pay and benefits. Schools in England are interested in recruiting teachers to motivate under-achieving Afro-Caribbean children. As Labour MP Diane Abbott stated, 'It's good in a way to bring in supply teachers from the Caribbean into schools where there are large numbers of Caribbean children. It's better than bringing them in from

Eastern Europe because they've never taught in multi-cultural schools' (Omar, 2002). Percentage-wise, there are very few black teachers in Britain's schools, even in schools where the student population exceeds 80 per cent black or other ethnic minority groups (Voice, 2002). It is reportedly difficult for the DfES to gauge exactly how many overseas-trained teachers there are working in the UK, as teachers can be employed on either a work permit or working holiday visa. Most schools record personnel data independently, so that there are no central figures about where teachers received their training. In 2001, Britain issued nearly 6,000 work permits to teachers from outside the European Union, mostly to South Africa, Canada, Australia, New Zealand and the US. This number is nearly three times as many as those who were recruited in 2,000. Table 12.8 delineates the breakdown of the permits.

3.1.13 Zambia

Zambia provided data based on 20 districts out of 72, with an added note 'that even if more districts submitted, the overall picture in terms of percentages would not change much' (Chilangwa, 2002). Teacher loss was reported as per Table 12.7.

The percentage of teacher loss is on the decline. Not surprisingly, Zambia's largest cause of teacher loss is death, which is most likely strongly associated with HIV/AIDS. According to UNAIDS, as of 2001, the adult HIV infection rate is 21.5 per cent and there are an estimated 570,000 current living orphans who have lost their mother or father or both parents to AIDS and who were alive and under the age of 15 at the end of 2001.

4. Qualitative research findings – The stories of teachers through focus groups

Due to time and other constraints of this study, we were only able to examine the experiences of teachers from Commonwealth member nations who work as teachers in the United Kingdom. Two focus groups were conducted in the London area, organised by a postgraduate student at the University of Brighton.

Table 12.7. Percentage of teacher loss in Zambia, by gender

	2000			2001			2002		
	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female
Overseas recruitment	0.0	0.1	0.0	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.1	0.0
Career change	0.3	0.4	0.2	0.3	0.4	0.2	0.1	0.2	0.1
Death	2.0	2.2	1.8	2.2	2.1	2.3	1.7	1.6	1.7
Retirement	0.8	1.2	0.4	0.9	1.0	0.7	0.6	0.7	0.5
Total % Loss	3.1	3.8	2.4	3.4	3.6	3.3	2.5	2.6	2.2

Table 12.8. UK-approved work permits where job includes teacher, January 2001 to January 2003, by country of origin.

	<i>Total population</i>	2001	2002	2003	<i>Total</i>
South Africa	43,309,000	2010	2542	150	4702
Australia	19,138,000	1011	1528	140	2679
New Zealand	3,855,400	609	887	52	1548
Jamaica	2,576,000	381	530	63	974
Canada	30,007,094	348	513	37	898
Zimbabwe	12,627,000	194	325	28	547
India	1,008,937,000	130	317	10	457
Ghana	19,306,000	53	123	13	189
Nigeria	113,862,000	60	90	2	152
Kenya	30,669,000	39	77	4	120
Trinidad & Tobago	1,294,000	43	50	4	97
Pakistan	141,256,000	22	43	5	70
Mauritius	1,161,000	19	45	2	66
Uganda	23,300,000	16	22	2	40
Zambia	10,421,000	16	22	-	38
Malaysia	11,308,000	16	17	1	34
Guyana	761,000	8	21	1	30
Sri Lanka	18,924,000	10	16	-	26
Barbados	267,000	15	9	-	24
Singapore	4,405,000	9	10	-	19
Cameroon	14,876,000	10	5	-	15
St. Lucia	148,000	5	10	-	15
Namibia	1,757,000	8	6	-	14
Malawi	11,308,000	3	10	-	13
Malta	390,000	5	8	-	13
Seychelles	80,000	2	10	1	13
Sierra Leone	4,405,000	4	8	1	13
Cyprus	784,000	7	3	-	10
St. Vincent	113,000	2	5	1	8
Bangladesh	137,439,000	1	3	1	5
Tanzania	35,119,000	3	1	1	5
Swaziland	925,000	-	3	-	3
Antigua	65,000	1	1	-	2
Botswana	1,541,000	-	1	-	1
Papua New Guinea	4,809,000	1	-	-	1
Samoa	159,000	1	-	-	1
St. Kitts	38,000	1	-	-	1
Vanuatu	197,000	1	-	-	1
TOTAL		5,064	7,261	519	12,844

Source: Work Permits (UK) section of Home Office

A series of open-ended questions were asked to address the issue of teacher loss due to teacher disaffection, retirement, and recruitment. For these particular groups, the issue of HIV/AIDS was not relevant, it seemed, and was not mentioned in the context of the discussion. A brief survey was also administered to understand more about their personal background, and the circumstances that brought them to the UK. Twelve of the 16 who participated in the focus group completed the survey, as four had to leave the session early.

The composition of both focus groups and key findings are summarised in Table 12.9 below:

Participants spoke of their reasons for leaving their home countries and ambitions for seeking employment in the UK, their experiences with recruitment firms, and general comments about their experiences teaching in London and in their home countries.

4.1 Reasons for coming to teach in the United Kingdom

In the first focus group, a number of the Jamaicans stated that they wanted to teach in the UK as a means to get higher education. This was not a theme which emerged in the second focus group, containing teachers from South Africa, India, Canada, Australia, and Jamaica.

Almost everyone identified travel and economic opportunity as other primary reasons. Several people mentioned the relevance of the working visa. One dimension was that

Table 12.9. Composition of teacher focus groups in the UK, and some findings

# Men	9
# Women	7
Country of origin	Jamaica - 9 South Africa - 3 Ghana - 1 India - 1 Canada - 1 Australia - 1
# Teachers who were qualified at home prior to arrival	12/12
# Teachers who would like to return home	12/12
# Teachers who would like to return home (but not to teach)	5/12
Way in which UK teaching position was identified	Internet - 4 Newspaper - 4 Teaching agency - 1 Friend - 1 Not identified - 2

it served as a good means to find relatively well-paying part-time employment as a supply teacher, and an opportunity to travel. Immediately after university, it was appealing to people in the focus groups from Australia, Ghana and South Africa. It seemed as if teaching was linked to personal development, and to the desires to learn and to experience a different culture.

Some focus group respondents did not see the opportunity to work as a teacher in England as an opportunity to further their career back home. For others, such as one teacher from India, it was essential in helping to further his opportunities when he returned home. A teacher from South Africa added: 'I think it is a springboard from here to Canada, or Australia or the United States...'

All of the people in the focus groups resigned from their positions at home as teachers, and were willing to take the risk in moving to England without having an opportunity waiting for them back home. Although for some working in England was not thought to help further their individual career, everyone agreed that working in England would help their financial status. A South African teacher added that there was a distinction between people from developing countries and developed countries as it related to financial risk and reward:

'I think the experience of people coming from developing countries is probably different in that sometimes we don't want to go back because the financial constraints at home are.. a lot worse and it is so nice being in a place where there is so much money, it's easy to live, financially secure, and much more stable. Whereas South Africa, every time I go back home it's more expensive. Inflation is skyrocketing. It is quite scary as a teacher when you don't get paid very well teaching...'

4.1.1 Teacher disaffection

Some teachers spoke of their frustrations with teaching conditions back home, while others spoke of their frustrations with teaching in London. All of the teachers included in the focus group were teaching in 'tough inner-city' London schools, where students have a general reputation for behavioural problems. Examples of teacher disaffection that motivated teachers to leave their home environments and seek employment in the UK included low pay and low status of the profession.

4.1.2 Discipline problems

Every individual spoke up, or nodded in agreement, on the topic of the poorly behaved and unruly children in London schools. According to one Australian teacher, 'n comparing Australian schools to London schools, 'but you call it challenging compared to here, is like a walk in the park.'

Teachers were shocked by the lack of discipline that they saw amongst the students in the inner-city London schools. One teacher spoke of being hit three times by students in his school. He continued to say that, 'When a discipline action occurs, I complete all this paperwork and nothing seems to happen. It is best not to call the child's home

in some cases because you might be adding insult to injury.... My main issue back home was violence... students fighting each other, but not the teacher. Yes, you are being pressured to manage your classroom, but how can you manage your classroom if students observe you being disrespected?' According to one Jamaican teacher:

'I have been hit by students three times in my school. Three times. I remember in Jamaica standing among three boys who were throwing fists in every direction, using pens at each other, and none of them tried to hit me or stab me or anything like that...'

Many of the teachers did not feel prepared or trained to handle the behavioural management issues simply because they did not exist at home. Both the Indian and Ghanaian participants commented that you would not have such behaviour at home. Some attributed this to the lack of parental involvement.

4.1.3 Recruitment agencies

The majority of individuals interviewed had been recruited through an agency, although some were recruited directly by a school in the Chelsea area of London. TES and Eteach.com were mentioned as websites that recruited teachers and were contracted directly by the boroughs. Recruitment agencies used several methods to recruit teachers, including advertising on the internet, recruiting via telephone, and advertising in the local Jamaican Sunday newspaper. Individuals also spoke about friends being asked to recruit individuals to take up teaching opportunities. One woman alleged that her school went to South Africa to recruit teachers, some of whom were unqualified teachers who had never spent any time in the classroom.

The following items in the Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol, adopted in 2004, show ways in which the document seeks to address the need for ethical recruitment practices on the part of recruitment businesses:

Protocol Article 3.8: The recruiting agency has an obligation to contact the intended source country in advance, and notify it of the agency's intentions. Recruiting countries will inform recruiting agencies of this obligation. Recruiting countries should inform source countries of any organised recruitment of teachers.

Protocol Article 3.9: Prior agreement should be reached between the recruitment agency and the government of the source country, regarding means of recruitment, numbers, and adherence to labour laws of the source country. Recruitment should be free from unfair discrimination and from any dishonest or misleading information, especially in regard to gender exploitation.

Protocol Article 3.15: As a targeted and responsive mode of reciprocation, bilateral agreements will provide for specific professional development opportunities or experiences for recruited teachers, who are about to return to the country of origin after a fixed term.

4.1.3.1 INFORMATION NEEDS

The majority of recruits were given little information before coming to the United Kingdom. One Jamaican teacher was given some information on the cost of housing and other expenses, but it proved to be inadequate. As he stated,

After I was in the job, they sent me another package about what my salary would be and the cost of living... about £200-300 a month in London. What they did not state, though, they did not tell you about council tax, and other expenses that you would incur.

It should be mentioned that the UK government initiated Quality Mark – a joint initiative between the Department of Education and Skills and Recruitment and Employment Confederation – to improve recruitment standards, but one must also address the issue of compliance with this standard (see Annex). It would appear that at least one agency which subscribes to Quality Mark, based on the focus group feedback, lapsed in its compliance to the standards and provided information which was incomplete and inadequate to at least one recruited teacher at the time of his recruitment.

4.1.3.2 RESPONSE TO THE NEEDS OF RECRUITS

Teachers spoke about inconsistencies between the information they received in their home (source) countries and the information that they received upon arrival. Before arrival in the country, they were uncertain about their contractual terms. Also, qualification issues, and qualification requirements for teaching in the destination country, were unclear before arrival.

They did not tell you about council tax, other expenses, TV licence. It just says about shopping and dining out, and that sort of thing, it doesn't give you any in-depth information. (Jamaican E)

I arrived in this country with £100. No one told me how far the money would stretch. I arrived, met some friends, and slept on their floor for four weeks. (South African)

One of the things I remember is that we were told that for us in our circumstances, there would be a tax-holiday type of situation where if you agree and are coming to teach for the two years, you will not be paying any taxes. Even after being here, they were still saying it – you are not supposed to be paying taxes. (Jamaican D)

Protocol Article 3.10: Wherever appointed, recruited teachers shall enjoy employment conditions not less than those of nationals of similar status and occupying similar positions.

Protocol Article 3.11: The recruited teacher is bound and subject to rules of national labour law and is also governed by any legislation or administrative rules relating to permission to work and suitability to work with children in the recruiting country.

Protocol Article 3.12: Further, where a complaints mechanism and procedure in relation to teachers' contracts of employment does not already exist in national legislation or administrative provision, one should be established for the purpose. The recruiting

agency shall inform recruited teachers of the names and contact details of all teachers unions in recruiting countries.

Protocol Article 3.13: Recruited teachers should be employed by a school or educational authority. Only schools and education authorities should obtain work permits to enable the employment of recruited teachers.

Protocol Article 3.14: A recruiting country shall ensure that the newly recruited teachers are provided with adequate orientation and induction programmes, including cultural adjustment programmes, with a focus on the school and its environment.

4.1.3.3 DISCRIMINATION IN THE RECRUITMENT PROCESS

Evidence of cultural discrimination in the recruiting process was identified.

They wanted black teachers to work with the black children. But they were getting South African teachers to work with the Caribbean children who could not understand what they were saying. (Jamaican E)

One black South African teacher was told by a recruitment agency that she should change her accent to make it sound more British. Her white and Indian South African colleagues had not received a similar request.

4.1.3.4 QUALIFICATIONS AND QTS REQUIREMENTS

Teachers were given very little guidance about the qualifications they would need to have to teach in the UK, or the QTS scheme, or tax issues related to pay. All of them arrived in the country as qualified, experienced teachers and were not made aware of the process required to become qualified in the UK to teach after the first four years, and the limitations of salary associated with levels of qualification.

Currently, the system is focused on the qualifications of teachers, rather than the equivalency of training and skills as a teacher.

I heard a story that a man... was trained like us in Jamaica, went through the rigorous training in a teacher's college, had about 15 or 16 years teaching experience, to a point where he was made head of the department. Upon arriving in the UK and contacting his school for a job, not through an agency he wanted to find a job on his own, who told him listen here now: According to our standards you are not a qualified teacher. I think it would best suit you if you seek a job as a classroom assistant. He was so angry. He said, 'How dare you tell me that! I am a teacher.' (Jamaican B)

Not one of the people interviewed received detailed information about the QTS requirements before arriving into the UK. They were given little guidance about the process, their entitlements, and the longer term expectations about the profession.

It was not until recently that I started to put together the pieces of the jigsaw (South Africa)

Protocol Article 3.10: The recruiting countries should also provide dedicated programmes to enable such teachers to achieve fully qualified status in accordance with any domestic requirements of the recruiting country.

Protocol Article 5.1: The recruited teacher has the right to transparency and full information regarding the contract of appointment. The minimum required information includes information regarding complaints procedures.

Protocol Article 5.2: Recruited teachers are in turn expected to show transparency in all dealings with their current and prospective employers, and to give adequate notice of resignation or requests for leave. Teachers also have a responsibility to inform themselves regarding all terms and conditions of current and future contracts of employment, and to comply with these.

4.1.4 Comparison of classroom standards

Inevitably, teachers spoke about their experiences teaching at home and compared them to those they have had teaching in London. Some teachers felt that they had become better teachers since they arrived in the UK and while others felt that the national curriculum has restricted their teaching to a point of deterioration and has caused them more frustration with teaching.

I used to get up and teach from a textbook, and no one ever worried about me. I was a terrible teacher and I have come here and realised how much more there is to teaching and how much more effort you can really put into it. (South African)

The resources here compared to our resources? [There] we had one tenth of the resources. (Jamaican C)

Both of these teachers have had positive experiences, using different resources in the classroom and learning different techniques. Others, however, have had the opposite experience:

I used to have students do poetry evenings. I do not feel compelled or have the interest to do that kind of thing because of the way the curriculum has you confined to certain (things) and all of that makes my job... I feel like my standard has dropped in that respect. I feel that I am conforming to the curriculum, the requirements of the curriculum rather than (being) a teacher to my students. (Jamaican D)

This was an important finding. One of the general assumptions is that teacher mobility will lead to greater job satisfaction, not more disaffection and frustration with the profession. The Jamaican teachers, in particular, have found the British system of examinations to be very restrictive, and also have not been able to use effectively their own skills from teachers' college. The irony is that Jamaican teachers are especially sought because of the similarities between the Jamaican and English systems of education.

4.1.5 Class size

Class size was discussed briefly, but was not raised as a point for teacher disaffection per se. One teacher did make the association between classroom size and linked it to behavioural problems and the difficulty the teacher has in monitoring larger classes. For the teacher from Ghana, the class size in England was a drastic improvement.

You are in a class of 30 whereas at home there were 20. You [have] ten less kids [in a London classroom]. (Australian)

I think a class of 20 is just excellent because we used to have 50 or 60 back in Africa. If your class was 30 you were lucky. It would be a very posh private school to get 30 kids in a classroom. The thing is, if you tell a kid to sit down and put a pen down, he does it. He'll do it straight away. (Ghanaian)

4.1.6 Administration requirements

Besides behavioural problems among the students, teachers also mentioned administrative requirements as a key reason for job frustration.

I also feel sometimes... you also have lots and lots of administrative work... it takes as much of my time, every day two or three hours spending on this, rather than improving my lesson. (Indian)

Every form you fill out is not teacher-friendly. At this school... you don't get the time to sit down and prepare a good lesson. (Australian)

One teacher mentioned his previous working environment where certain staff were appointed specifically to handle the administrative tasks, which enabled the teachers to devote time to their lesson plans, working with students, and improving their methods as teachers. Others commented on the potential advantages of such a system.

4.2 Summary

This review of both quantitative and qualitative data has resulted not only in the discovery of reasons for teacher disaffection and teacher loss, but also revealed methodological issues in assessing the impact of teacher loss. The pan-Commonwealth survey and statistics available from other sources, particularly from the UK, helped us to understand the scope of the problem and determine some of the frequent paths of mobility across countries. The focus groups helped provide insight into teachers' perceptions about the profession, factors contributing to frustration, and long-term ambitions. In determining the impact of teacher loss, one needs to more fully understand both the immediate and the long-term impact of teacher loss. Are the ramifications different in losing a newly qualified teacher who wishes to obtain a working holiday permit than in losing an experienced one who is planning to retire?

Two factors are very important to consider: What is the overall population of the source country? What are the age demographics of the source country? Clearly, small

states will suffer most in trying to replace already scarce human capital. However, more needs to be understood about the needs and ambitions of those teachers who choose to leave small states, and about the means which will be required to retain them. The mass retirement of experienced teachers, primarily in Canada, Australia and the US, is fuelling demand for teacher recruitment. However, in an era of globalisation and information technology, what type of teachers is needed to replace this lost capital? Do we fully understand the skills, talent, and cultural backgrounds of the teachers needed? Do they fully understand the implications of their move, the cost of living in what seems to be a new place full of opportunity? These are all areas for further research.

Additional articles in the Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol address some of these issues:

Protocol Article 3.1: It is the responsibility of the authorities in recruiting countries to manage domestic teacher supply and demand in a manner that limits the need for resort to organised recruitment in order to meet the normal demand for teachers. At the same time the right of any country to recruit teachers from wherever these may be obtained is recognised.

Protocol Article 3.2: It is recognised that the organised recruitment of teachers may be detrimental to the education systems of source countries, and to the costly human resource investments that have [been] made in teacher education. Recruiting and source countries should agree on mutually acceptable measures to mitigate any harmful impact of such recruitment. Where requested by source countries, recruiting and source countries shall enter into bi-lateral discussions and make every effort to reach an agreement which will provide for such measures. Consideration will be given to forms of assistance such as technical support for institutional strengthening, specific programmes for recruited teachers, and capacity building to increase the output of trained teachers in source countries.

Protocol Article 3.3: Recruiting countries shall make every effort to ensure that departure of recruited teachers is avoided during the course of the academic year of the source country, to prevent the disruption of teaching programmes.

5. The teaching profession and the dimensions of teacher loss due to recruitment, teacher disaffection, career change, and HIV/AIDS

Based on the findings of the data, some general statements can be made about teacher recruitment, teacher disaffection and career change. Unfortunately, due to the nature of the sample, HIV/AIDS did not come up as a point in any of the focus groups. Similarly, retirement also did not feature in the discussion apart from one Jamaican teacher briefly mentioning that he would plan to retire soon.

5.1 Recruitment agencies play a key role in teacher mobility

As the founder of one recruitment agency stated, 'International recruiting is nothing new. In the corporate world, the most sought-after position is engineers; in education,

it's teachers.' The recruitment business is based on the principles of industry, and can be very profitable. The mobility of labour is a global reality and the demand for teachers remains very high throughout the world. Just as one must analyse the impact of lost resources on the organisation, one must also consider the impact of the loss of a teacher to the school and community. In the developing world, where one teacher may teach up to 70 students in a community where a teacher's role extends beyond the role of instructor to that of supervisor, HIV/AIDS counsellor, disciplinarian and community leader, the impact of teacher loss has wider implications than in industrialised societies where the teacher's role may be more limited to classroom duties.

5.2 Teacher qualifications

There is also an important distinction to be made between the qualifications needed to do 'supply teaching' (or to be a 'substitute teacher') and the requirements to teach full-time in the classroom. The different requirements of these two jobs is affecting the supply and demand for teachers and impacting on the labour issue. In the focus groups, several teachers spoke of having holiday visas, having the opportunity to travel, and earn money as supply teachers for two years. Should the qualifications and long-term ambitions of the individual teacher both be factors in the recruitment process and targeted position? These are also areas for further research.

Also, how can UK NARIC and other organisations in other countries correctly evaluate the equivalency of teacher qualifications? Anomalies exist in the current schedules for the remuneration and status of teachers from recruiting countries when they are compared to those recruited from source countries. A teacher with over ten years of experience in Jamaica may arrive as an unqualified teacher in the United Kingdom and be subjected to a different pay scale before obtaining the QTS. How can ten years of experience be assessed and understood in the new (in this case English) context?

5.3 Teacher disaffection

Several reasons were cited as to why teachers wish to migrate. These include personal ambitions to improve their financial standing, travel, gain experience, and learn from elsewhere. However, when expectations were not met, compensation was not fully understood, and conditions were worse than anticipated, teachers became disaffected in their new environments.

5.3.1 Compensation should be made clear

Teachers are tempted by recruiting agencies with offers of daily rates for teaching of between £100 and £130. For example, the average principal in Jamaica earns about J\$40,000 a month (nearly £600) while the average class teacher earns in a month J\$24,000 or close to £350, which is less than they would earn in a week in Britain (*The Voice*, 2002). However, if these supply teachers become ill or must be absent for the day, they are not paid.

5.3.2 Teachers must be motivated

Teacher mobility does bring advantages of experience and gives teachers a different perspective in the classroom. Allowing teachers to experience other teaching environments can help improve their attitudes toward teaching at home in the Caribbean region. For example, Caribbean teachers have found a lack of discipline in the New York classrooms. In theory, teachers could gain extra qualifications and beneficial experiences from their overseas experiences. However, steps need to be taken to secure such benefits. In this study, we found evidence of teachers frustrated by the requirements of qualifications, frustrated by constrictive teaching methods, and bogged down in administrative work. If they had already been frustrated about the profession before moving abroad, it is likely that they became more frustrated after moving.

Trinidad and Tobago engaged in improving teacher development programmes, sabbatical leave, assistance programmes, a revision of school management systems, and a compensation review. Guyana is pursuing a policy of teacher training and continuing efforts to improve the compensation of teachers.

As Burchell Whiteman, former Jamaican Minister of Education points out, Jamaica and the rest of the region cannot compete in terms of money, but there are other initiatives that can be undertaken. In Jamaica, scholarships were being offered to aspiring teachers and plans are being put into place to train all teachers to graduate level.

Policymakers and organisations such as VSO have encouraged people to think of teaching not as a career for life but as an occupation which might be undertaken for a period of years, before turning to or returning to another profession. Several people who were interviewed had that perception for themselves, or for their friends – that teaching was a way to travel, contribute, explore, gain better financial security, as well as serve in the classroom.

The 15th Conference of Commonwealth Education Ministers has chosen the conference theme ‘Closing the Gap – Access, Inclusion and Achievement’. Similarly, the Dakar (2000) framework of ‘Education for All’ focused on access, equity and elimination of gender disparities but put less emphasis on the quality of education. The evidence from this report alludes to a difference between access to education, and access to quality education. The role of the teacher is paramount in providing this quality. Securing teachers requires securing their position, another motivation, and providing them with the best means to enable them to teach.

6. Recommendations for further investigation

The findings of this study provide insights into how Commonwealth countries could work together to potentially minimise the gap between teacher demand and teacher supply and counter unethical practices in the recruitment of teachers. They also helped to identify important areas requiring further investigation:

1. Further investigate the consequences of teacher mobility at home.

2. Further explore the definitions of 'teacher' and the 'teaching profession'.
3. Further explore the practices of recruitment firms, and compliance with initiatives such as the Quality Mark.
4. Explore in detail the issue of qualification requirements, and the compatibility of requirements based on the needs determined by certain jobs.
5. Investigate the true requirements for supply and permanent teachers.

References

- AEU (Australian Education Union) (no date) www.aeufederal.org.au/Campaigns/teachersupply.pdf
- Anderson, Omar (2002) 'More teachers set to leave', *The Weekly Gleaner*, April 10-16.
- Bray, M. (1992) *Educational Planning in Small Countries*. International Institute for Educational Planning, UNESCO, Paris.
- Brock, C. (1988) 'Beyond the Fringe? Small States and the Provision of Education', *Comparative Education*, 24, 2.
- Canada Newswire (2003) 'Regulating body works with post-secondary institutions to respond to teacher shortage', July 16.
- Cappon, Paul (2002) Letter from the Council of Ministers of Education, Canada, dated December 10, 2002 and signed by Paul Cappon, Director General.
- Chilangwa, Barbara Y. (2002) Email of response addressed to the Commonwealth Secretariat, dated 30 December 2002 from Barbara Y Chilangwa, Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Education.
- Commonwealth Secretariat (2003) *DRAFT A Protocol for the Recruitment of Commonwealth Teachers*. See www.thecommonwealth.org.
- Commonwealth Secretariat (2004) *Commonwealth Teacher Recruitment Protocol*. Adopted by Ministers of Education at Stoke Rochford Hall Conference Centre, Lincolnshire, United Kingdom, September 1st Commonwealth Secretariat, London.
- Coulthard, M. and C. Kyriacou (2002) 'Does teaching as a career offer what students are looking for?' in Ian Menter et al (eds.) *The Crisis in Teacher Supply research and strategies for retention*. Trentham Books, Stoke on Trent, UK.
- Daily Mail, Saturday March 16, 2002
- de Rebello, D. (2002) Presentation to Section for Education for Sustainable Development, UNESCO, Paris, 19 February.
- Degazon-Johnson, R. (2003) 'Teachers at Risk'. *The Response of Commonwealth Small States to the depletion of Human Resources in their Education Sectors*. Commonwealth Secretariat, London.
- Farrell, J.P. and J.B. Oliveira (1993) *Teachers in Developing Countries: Improving effectiveness and managing costs*. World Bank, Washington, DC.
- Goodfellow, Nhada. (2003) 'SA heading for teacher crisis', *Adelaide Advertiser*, 16 August.
- GoUK (2002) Annual report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Schools: Standards and Quality in Education 2001/02, section on 'Teacher training, development and supply'.
- Guyana Chronicle Online* (2002) Editorial 'Finding a solution to teacher migration', 4 April 2002.

- Hutchings, M., I. Menter, A. Ross, and D. Thomson (2002) 'Teacher supply and retention in London - Key findings and implications from a study carried out in six boroughs in 1998/1999' in M. Hutchings et al (eds) *The Crisis in Teacher Supply research and strategies for retention*. Trentham Books, Stoke on Trent, pp.182-3.
- Hutchinson, Sascha (2003) 'Ageing workforce hits home', *The Australian*, 25 August.
- Kelly, M.J. (1999) 'What HIV/AIDS Can Do to Education, and What Education Can Do to HIV/AIDS'. Paper presented to the All Sub-Saharan Africa Conference on Education for All - 2000, Johannesburg, 6-10 December, 1999.
- Fidler, S & Marsh, V. (2002) 'Sense of crisis as migrants keep moving', *Financial Times* 25 July, p.9.
- Nichols, J. (2002) *From The Perspective of A Recruiter*. Brief prepared on 20 May, 2002.
- PARU (The Policy Analysis and Research Unit) (2002) 'Recruitment of Jamaican Teachers by Overseas Agencies'. October.
- Postlethwaite, T.N. (ed.) (1995) *International Encyclopedia of National Systems of Education*. Pergamon, Oxford.
- Scott, F. (2001) 'Developing human resources for effective school management in small Caribbean states', *International Journal of Educational Development*, 21.
- Siniscalco, M.T. (2002) *A statistical profile of the teaching profession. International Labour Office (ILO) and United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization*. UNESCO, Geneva.
- Stiglitz, J. (2002) *Globalization and its Discontents*. Penguin, London.
- Voice (2002) 'Plugging the Caribbean brain drain', May 20.
- Voluntary Service Overseas (2002) *What makes teachers tick?* VSO, London.
- Winters, L. Alan, Terrie L. Walmsley, Zhen Kun Wang, and Roman Grynberg (2002) *Negotiating the Liberalisation of the Temporary Movement of Natural Persons*, University of Sussex at Brighton, Discussion Paper 87, October.

ANNEX I

The Savannah Accord

Whereas Ministers of Education of the Commonwealth Caribbean, meeting at the Savannah in Barbados, on this the second day of July, 2002, are deeply concerned about the loss of teachers from our education systems (whether for reasons of recruitment by other countries, disaffection with the teaching environment leading to career change, or death due to the HIV/AIDS epidemic), and are in accord that swift action is needed to address this situation; conscious nevertheless of the potential opportunities for our countries available through a structured and well-managed programme of teacher exchange and of trade in skills;

We call upon our colleague Commonwealth Ministers of Education in general, and the thirty-two Ministers of Education of Small States in particular, on whose countries the depletion of the human resource in education has the greatest immediate and prolonged impact, to:

- Conduct national research to **determine the extent of teacher loss** and the short and long-term impact on each country's education system and provide the outcomes of this national research to the Commonwealth Secretariat within a three-month period from this day.
- Intensify the **sharing of information on best practice** within the member states in relation to human resource and performance management strategies affecting our teachers and our schools.
- Support the **conduct of a Pan-Commonwealth study** of the problem, findings of which shall be presented at a special session of the 15CCEM in Scotland, 2003, entitled 'Teachers at Risk'.
- **Mandate the Commonwealth Secretariat to develop a draft protocol/code of practice for the recruitment of teachers** in the Commonwealth which should include:
 - A development assistance programme by recruiting countries to compensate for the loss of human capacity.
 - Regulatory guidelines and controls for recruiters which will address the standards and quality of the recruitment process from contracting stage through orientation and induction of teachers.
- **Invite the collaboration of diplomatic representatives of Small States** - Consuls General, High Commissioners and Ambassadors - in negotiating with representatives of recruiting agencies, states and countries.

Annex 2

The Quality Mark

[Source: <http://www.rec.uk.com/press-centre/qm.htm>]

The Quality Mark is a joint initiative between the Department for Education and Skills (DfES) and the Recruitment and Employment Confederation (REC), which is an industry body for employment agencies and businesses. It is hoped that it will improve the standards of supply teachers for both the supply teachers themselves and the schools that use them.

The Quality Mark sets the minimum standards for agencies and local education authorities in such areas as the way they recruit and interview supply teachers, the way they check and manage their supply teachers, and the way they stay at the forefront of changes in the teaching sector. The REC administers and awards the Mark, in close co-operation with the DfES. All LEAs and agencies (trading for at least one year) which provide temporary teachers are eligible to apply for the Quality Mark. They will be required to submit written evidence to show that they meet the standards as outlined. Checks will be made.

The main objectives of the Quality Mark are:

- To recognise private sector supply agencies and LEAs who are able to demonstrate that they meet standards of good practice in managing and providing supply teachers for schools.
- To enable schools and temporary teachers to feel confident about the quality of the agencies and LEAs with which they are dealing.
- To raise the standards and status of supply teaching.
- To recognise the contributions made by supply teachers, agencies and LEAs in supporting schools.

As of September 2003, the following organisations have been awarded the Quality Mark:

Academy Supply Agency Ltd; Capita Education Resourcing; Celsian; Dream Education; Focus Education; GB Recruitment (Staffs) Ltd; GSL Education; ITN Teachers; Kelly Educational Staffing; Link Education Ltd; Louis Paul Recruitment; Protocol Teachers; Quay Education Services; Reed Education Professionals; Renaissance Education; Select Education Plc; SOS Education Services; Standby Teacher Services; Supply Desk; Supplynet Recruitment Ltd; Teach London; Teachers Workline; Teaching Personnel Ltd; TimePlan Education Group Ltd; and UK Teaching Appointments Ltd.

The Quality Mark Selection and Referral

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Referral</i>
1. All relevant checks are undertaken. Schools notified in writing of checks not completed.	Statement of selection and referral policy; registrations with CRB; standard check forms (e.g. for identity, permission to work, GTC registration, references, and qualifications checks); standard medical declaration.
2. A personal face-to-face interview is conducted by a trained interviewer.	Standard letters (or invitations to attend an interview); interview notes; recruitment policy statement; CVs / training records of interviewing staff.
3. Relevant induction materials are provided in writing, including a clear statement of arrangements for pay, conditions or employment and pension entitlements.	Copy of standard teacher's contract. Joining / introduction pack.
4. At least two references are followed up in all cases, including previous agencies/LEAs with whom the teacher may have been registered and Headteachers.	Standard letters. Recruitment policy statement.
5. Where an agency/LEA recruits overseas, local recruitment requirements are satisfied. Overseas teachers are familiarised with key aspects of English education provision. And, where appropriate, the standards of this Mark are fully adhered to for overseas teachers, including home country reference and criminal record checks.	Statement of policy on overseas recruitment. Exemplar induction materials for overseas teachers, to include explication of National Curriculum requirements and Key Stage standards.
6. Solicits feedback on teachers' performance from schools.	Feedback forms/ policy statement.
7. Acts on schools' comments by giving regular feedback to teachers and assists in identifying development needs.	Feedback forms/ policy statement.
8. Has procedures in place for terminating the engagement of teachers where appropriate.	Statement of management policy including child protection/discipline/complaints statement. Details of procedures for making referrals to GTC, DfES, police in cases of incompetence/ misconduct.
9. Where appropriate (i.e. LEAs), facilitates the appraisal of supply teachers who are eligible for the performance pay threshold.	Statement of management policy.
10. Provides information about opportunities for professional development.	Statement of management policy. Examples of information circulars.

<i>Standard</i>	<i>Referral</i>
11. To assist and support teachers' preparation, provides access to CPD and curriculum materials and equipment as required.	Inventory of available materials, opportunities and equipment.
12. Takes all reasonable steps to ensure teachers are provided with relevant information about schools (e.g. time table; directions; details of the class(es) they will be teaching; information about any pupils with special educational needs; other adults (i.e. teaching assistants); line management arrangements.	Induction pack. Information sought from schools.
13. Contributes to the compilation of a personal portfolio of training and development for each teacher, recording: training undertaken; assessments; qualifications; and appraisals.	Example of a personal portfolio; training policy statement.
14. Maintains knowledge and awareness of current initiatives in education.	CVs of all educationally qualified personnel (e.g. Qualified teachers).
15. Provides opportunities for specific personal development for NQTs (opportunities for induction); and overseas trained teachers (opportunities to pursue QTS through employment based training routes).	Statement of policy on Induction for NQTs and overseas teachers.
16. Provides schools with accurate teacher profile information (i.e. outlines how it will meet the school's requirements, endeavouring to provide teachers with appropriate skills and qualifications).	Copy of material sent to schools.
17. Communicates recruitment policy to schools.	Policy statement on contacts with schools.
18. Transparency in dealing with schools is important, especially in relation to charges. Agrees charges with schools and pay with teachers and informs schools in advance of any significant changes to previous rates.	Statement of policy on fees and charges. Information provided to schools on fees and charges (if difference). Copy of Terms of Business.
19. Follows up complaints and concerns (from schools and teachers) arising from the placement of teachers according to a formal complaints procedure.	Copy of complaints procedure.

Annex 3

Qualitative research interview guides

Questions by Jacqueline Clark

1. Did you have information needs, and if so, what are they?
2. What info would you have liked to have had? What surprised you?
3. Did the information that you receive change when you arrived in the UK?
4. Where were you placed?
5. If you were placed in inner-city schools, were you told about the situation?
6. What were you told about the classroom environment of the students?
7. How did you find out about QTS?
8. Whose responsibility is it to provide you with information?

Additional questions (as appropriate)

Related to above:

1. Do you have the job that you thought that you would get?
2. Are you getting the remuneration that you expected (in salary and in benefits)? How does this compare to what you were earning at home?
3. Please talk about your experience with your recruitment firm and the various people responsible for your employment.

Additional questions

1. Please describe your background and experiences as a teacher.
2. Please describe the teaching conditions in your home country.
3. What were some of your reasons for coming to the UK?
4. Does your current compensation package (including any benefits, or opportunities for further training) meet the expectations you had before you came to the UK?
5. Please describe how you learnt about the job in the UK and your process to come to the UK to teach.
6. How are you finding your job and the teaching profession in the UK?
7. How are you finding the students and the school environment?
8. Please compare what it is like to work in a school in your home country and to work in a school in England.
9. Are you pleased that you decided to move to the UK? Why or why not?
10. Would you like to go back your country? If so, why and when?

Probing questions for wider group (as suggested by Commonwealth Secretariat)

1. Can you please compare and contrast your experiences working in a developed country vs. working in a developing country?
2. Did you feel that you had adequate training to meet the needs of your new position?
3. Have you worked with the teachers union in your country of employment? If so, how?
4. Are you currently receiving any subsidies for training? Any external bursaries?
5. In your home country, did you pay for your teacher training? Did you receive any subsidies? If so, are you expected to pay back anything, in service or fees?
6. Did your contracts at home give you the option to return to your position after working abroad?

Annex 4

Estimated number of current living orphans

Estimated number of current living orphans, by country, total, from 2001 to 2001
Source: UNAIDS/WHO/UNICEF Epidemiological Fact Sheets on HIV/AIDS and STIs, September 2002

The presentation of material on the maps contained herein does not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or areas or of its authorities, or concerning the delineation of its frontiers or boundaries.



