

2

Approaches to Development Planning and Gender Analysis

From Women in Development to Gender and Development

Efforts to promote gender equality have in recent years shifted in focus from 'women in development' to 'gender and development'. The 'women in development' approach began with an uncritical acceptance of existing social structures and focused on how women could be better integrated into existing development initiatives. Targeting women's productive work to the exclusion of their reproductive work, this approach was characterised by income-generating projects for women that failed to address the systemic causes of gender inequality. It also tended to view women as passive recipients of development assistance, rather than as active agents in transforming their own economic, social, political and cultural realities.

A key outcome was that woman's concerns were viewed in isolation, as separate issues, leading to their marginalisation in the state system and other structures.

The gender and development approach, which forms the basis of the Plan of Action, focuses more on the fact that women and men have different life courses and that development policies affect them differently. It seeks to address these differences by mainstreaming gender into development planning at all levels and in all sectors, focusing less on providing equal treatment for men and women (since equal treatment does not necessarily result in equal outcomes) and more on taking whatever steps are necessary to ensure equal outcomes. It recognises that improving the status of women cannot be understood as a separate, isolated issue and can only be achieved by taking into account the status of both women and men.

The gender and development approach is built on an awareness not only of the differences between men and women but also of the inequalities that emanate from these differences. It seeks to address not only women's practical gender needs (the immediate material needs of women in their existing roles as, for example, housewives and mothers) but also their strategic gender interests (the necessity of changing the position of women in society – addressing inequalities in employment, political participation and cultural and legal status).

Table 1 presents a typology of government attempts to address gender issues in development planning. While the contexts within which these policy approaches have been attempted vary, broadly speaking, the welfare, anti-poverty and efficiency approaches can be linked to a WID framework, while equity and empowerment/transformation are more consistent with the GAD framework.

Practical and Strategic Gender Needs

Because men and women have different roles and responsibilities, they also have different needs, identified as practical and strategic gender needs.

Practical gender needs emanate from the actual conditions people experience due to the gender roles ascribed to them by society. In the case of women, these needs are often related to women's roles as mothers, homemakers and providers of basic needs. Projects can meet the practical gender needs of both men and women without necessarily changing their relative position in society.

Strategic gender needs point to what is required to overcome the generally subordinate position of women to men in society and relate to women's empowerment. Such needs vary according to social, economic and political context. Most governments now acknowledge the need to create opportunities which enable women to address their strategic needs.

Table 1 **A Typology of Government Attempts to Engender Development Planning**

Policy Approach	Role of the State	Type of Development	Planning Data
Welfare It is seen as a safety net to cushion the negative impact of the 'free market' on the lives of poor people. Locate women in family.	Limited role. Only acts when there is extreme pressure. Then promotes an incremental, piecemeal response to address symptoms through sectors.	Based on promoting accelerated economic growth through industrialisation. Limited emphasis on building human resources except in respect of skills for the market.	Limited to socioeconomic indicators with human development index (HDI) more recently. Little information on gender. Not much sectoral information except in the health sector
Anti-Poverty Promotes the thinking that helping poor women will increase their productivity and promote economic growth. Poverty is seen as the problem due to under-development – not unequal power relations.	Role seen only as co-ordination through nation-wide anti-poverty campaigns. Emphasis on improving women as 'vehicles of development' not in their own right.	Neglect of rural economy. Modernising economy and promoting small scale businesses and income generating products. Emphasis on employing women in certain sectors such as the service industry/craft. 'Trickle down' effect of economic growth to benefit women.	Central Statistical Services (CSS) provide national data. Emphasis on socioeconomic indices and Human Development Index. Data obtained only in respect of numbers of women experiencing poverty.
Efficiency Recent approach. Acceptance that because of changing global arrangements women's production role as cheap labour is critical to economic development. Thinking women can help to make the system work better.	Promotes private sector involvement in employment of women. Promotes policy of equal opportunities not equality of conditions. Does not interfere in regulating market but emphasis is on labour policies and skills development	Economic development and faster growth through human resource capacity building. Emphasis on vocational skills and training unemployed. Modernisation and rural development.	CSS obtain data emphasis on HDI, levels of literacy, etc. Economic indices and human resources. Breakdown information on female 'dropouts' from school etc.
Equity Promotes recognition of women's contribution to development (waged and unpaid) and fair treatment because of its value.	Regulatory role high. State provides legal framework for fair treatment of women especially in political and economic sphere.	Based on increased state regulation by the economic sector and active state intervention. State led economic growth through modernisation.	General statistical data relevant to HDI and economic indices of development. Emphasis on sex-disaggregated data to show gender inequities.

Planners generally respond to the practical needs of women without relating these to their strategic needs. Strategic gender needs are the needs of women which arise out of their subordinate position to men in society. They relate to institutionalised patterns of discrimination such as gender divisions of labour, denial of legal rights to women, and women's lack of access to power and control over their bodies. Strategic gender interests and needs are linked to practical, material needs. A twin approach is required which identifies the links between practical and strategic gender needs and proposes policy and planning frameworks to address both within institutions. Development responses that remain exclusively within the 'add-on' project approach tend to be inadequate to meeting strategic gender needs.

Women's Role in Decision-making	Macroeconomic Framework	Integration of Gender in Planning	Distribution of Resources	Impact on Gender Inequalities
Limited marginal role. Medium to high part in community managing and in household. Participation in meeting practical needs through projects.	Emphasis on reducing deficits, cutting back on public expenditure, especially on social services. Repayment of debt and servicing. Women seen as dependants.	No efforts made. Gender seen as women's responsibility through welfare departments.	Limited funding. High reliance on donor aid for self-help projects. Tax incentives for private sector to assist with poverty alleviation through social responsibility.	No impact. Some practical needs met. Women seen as passive recipients of welfare. Their only recognised roles are reproduction and community management.
Not promoted. Limited to women's organisations and projects. Only evident in projects and NGOs.	Same as welfare except emphasis on donor support and funds to address poverty. Introduction of public works programmes. Emphasis on role of the poor in informal economy as survival strategy.	Not evident in Commonwealth governments except through (women's units) in welfare departments and rural development strategies.	Funding through loans and grants available for anti-poverty programmes. Donor and private sector support provided for small income generating projects.	Limited to only meeting practical gender needs (basic needs) but often not very successfully.
Increase numbers of women in economic activity. Emphasis on local self management uses women to carry out tasks.	Emphasis on efficient management of economy increased productivity investments from domestic and foreign capital. Trade liberalisation, lowering deficit and taxes, increasing education and health budgets, promoting domestic savings	No structural changes. Integration through sectoral programme/project plans especially in education health and welfare or women's units.	Funds for sectors through national budgets – health, education and unemployment programmes. Donor support small business and income generating projects of women. Support training projects, especially for women.	Greater visibility of women in productive roles. Increases women's alienation, exploitation and burden of multiple roles, preventing them from using increased participation to change decision-making structures. Structural inequalities remain.
Promote increased role. See women as already in decision-making structures but in need of recognition.	Increased deficits. Investment in public enterprises. High taxes on corporations. Public service and social expenditure high. States affected by ESAPs.	Non-existent in community. Would be high if it took off. But state power usually means male domination.		Using an equity approach has some potential in respect of gender but on its own it cannot address systemic problems of inequality.

Table 1 continued A Typology of Government Attempts to Engender Development Planning

Policy Approach	Role of the State	Type of Development	Planning Data
Empowerment/Transformation By raising gender awareness and a critical analysis of social and structural problems through mass based popular development education, poor women and men would become empowered and enabled to use democratic space to change or engage in a process of transforming oppressive structures, policies and programmes. Process to lead to economic, political, social, empowerment of women.	Significant role in promoting rights of women and poor people. Important role in ensuring democratic practices and promoting a critical partnership between organisations of civil society. Enforcement of human rights and protocols for workers' rights.	Integrated, sustainable. Promoting economic growth and redistribution. Emphasis on limiting monopolies promoting rural and urban development. Increased role of NGOs and CSOs in development process	Change national census process. All data to be broken down in terms of gender, race and other categories. Both social and economic indicators. Push for new indices to measure women's work and its value.

Table 2

Source: Moser (1993: 49)

a Changing the gender division of labour

b Control over financial services

c Overcoming discrimination

against women owning land, by

law or tradition

d Sharing the burden of domestic

labour between women and men

Multiple roles of women and meeting gender needs

Women engage in multiple roles within the sphere of social reproduction and what is termed productive activity. These roles are categorised by Moser as follows:

- ♦ **the productive role:** this refers to market production and home/subsistence production undertaken by women which generates an income (whether financial or 'in kind');
- ♦ **the reproductive role:** this refers to the childbearing and child-rearing responsibilities borne by women – which are essential to the reproduction of the workforce; and
- ♦ **the community management role:** this refers to activities undertaken by women to ensure the provision of resources at the community level, as an extension of their reproductive role (1993: 49).

To emphasise one against the other is to lose sight of the fact that women are carrying a heavy burden and that their actual working hours far outnumber those of men working in the productive sector.

Moser (1993: 49) proposes a way to link women's practical needs to strategic gender needs (see Table 2). She identifies the type of intervention in three areas/sectors (employment, human settlement and basic services), the different roles women play in respect of reproduction, production and community managing activities and whether in these examples the needs would be practical or strategic. Using Table 2 as a tool to address the multiple roles of women can be one way to bring about a change in women's positions. Planners could use Table 2 to analyse whether government policy in key areas is responding to gender needs in the different spheres in which women live and work.

Table 2 also indicates that because women still spend excessive amounts of time and energy on practical gender needs they do not have the time to mobilise for change on strategic gender needs (see column on gender need met).

Women's Role in Decision-making	Macroeconomic Framework	Integration of Gender in Planning	Distribution of Resources	Impact on Gender Inequalities
Promoted at all levels. Not only in terms of increased numbers but assisting through training to help women make informed decisions and through participation change quality of decision making and its processes.	Emphasis on meeting fundamental human needs through state social and economic goals. Increasing consumption. Deficits not seen as important. Increased taxation. Greater participation of the poor in economy. Promotion of social market – mixed economy approach. Increased labour intensive employment strategies.	New structures and policies required. Gender to be included and integrated into development planning.	Public funds used to bring about land reform, restitution and agricultural development. Increases in social service budgets, efficient public sector with public enterprises to show profit. Donor grants for restructuring governance. Training and education of women not widely accepted.	Potential impact to address strategic gender needs great. But not accepted by mainstream development agencies. Promoted through progressive women's movements.

Table 2 Women's Triple Role and Meeting Practical/Strategic Gender Needs

Type of Intervention	Women's Role Recognised			Gender Need Met	
	Reproductive	Productive	Community Management	Practical	Strategic
1 Employment Policy					
(i) Skill training					
Cooking	♦			♦	
Dressmaking		♦		♦	
Masonry/carpentry		♦		♦	♦ ^a
(ii) Access to credit					
Allocated to household		♦		♦	
Allocated to women		♦		♦	♦ ^b
2 Human Settlement Policy					
(i) Zoning legislation					
Separates residence and work	♦				
Does not separate residence and work	♦	♦		♦	
(iii) House ownership					
In man's name	♦			♦	
In woman's name	♦	♦		♦	♦ ^c
3 Basic Services					
(i) Location of nursery					
Located in community	♦	♦	♦	♦	
Mother's workplace	♦	♦		♦	
Father's workplace	♦	♦		♦	♦ ^d
(ii) Transport services					
Only peak-hour bus service		♦		♦	
Adequate off-peak service	♦	♦	♦	♦	
(iii) Timing of rural extension meetings					
In the morning		♦		♦	
In the afternoon/evening	♦	♦	♦	♦	