

Chapter 3

Policies and Practices

Despite differences between each of the countries in terms of size, population, culture and political infrastructure, there are distinct similarities between all pertaining to the under-staffing of qualified teachers to the rural areas, and strong gender imbalances. This chapter looks at some of the policy provisions and institutional arrangements that are in place for recruiting and deploying teachers.

All four countries have devised policy frameworks for bringing their out-of-school children back into school through education sector plans, structural reform or legal constitutional Acts. The expansionist drive inherent in each represents a key challenge in itself, as each country struggles to develop suitable infrastructure at an accelerated pace, and the mass training and recruitment of teachers is a key aspect of this aim. However, more teachers does not automatically result in equitably distributed teachers according to need, and the imbalance demonstrated in the previous chapter runs the risk of being exacerbated if deployment policy and practice are not combined correctly.

Teacher deployment systems

Methods of teacher deployment vary, and the four case studies in this book again show both similarities and differences in their processes. Arguably and broadly speaking, two main systems exist – deployment by a central authority or deployment by a ‘market system’ (Mulkeen, 2005). Centrally planned systems can either be directed from the national or provincial level, and their rationale is based on the premise that they will ensure the fair deployment of teachers, free from local pressures. However, not surprisingly the greatest drawback with centralised systems is the inability to keep abreast and respond quickly to local-level needs. Decentralising the teacher deployment process has become an approach reviewed and in some cases adopted by ministries in an attempt to create more efficiency.

'Market' systems provide teachers not through a central system where teachers are recruited and deployed to schools, but where teachers apply for specific posts in schools of their choice. Such a system is more naturally conducive to the private sector. Schools have more autonomy in this process, and this can be beneficial as the needs of the locale are addressed directly. Arguably, this better ensures the hiring of local teachers. Another benefit is the expediency that the system provides, avoiding as it does the 'red tape' and distant processes of centrally-determined recruitment machinery. However, this system has the very large disadvantage of easily perpetuating some of the disparities that even the centralised system struggles with: for example, it ensures that the most qualified teachers go to the most desirable locations (often urban), leaving rural areas with minimal competition and the least qualified teachers.

The countries in this book have undergone varying degrees and attempts at decentralisation and devolution towards the aim of empowering provincial and district-level management with authority in making key education decisions. This has had mixed results for teacher deployment processes. The following summaries give an overview of the basic deployment frameworks in each of the countries: Nigeria, Pakistan, Papua New Guinea and Tanzania.

Nigeria

As earlier indicated, Nigeria operates a three-tier system of government, federal, state and local governments. Education is on the concurrent legislative list, whereby each of the tiers can set up schools, employ and deploy teachers within its jurisdiction. There are, however, national bodies that coordinate the implementation of policies, as shown in chapter one.

As a matter of policy, the federal government does not operate primary schools and, by the Universal Basic Education Act, is disengaging in the running of junior secondary schools because they now form part of the nine-year basic education¹. By law, local governments are supposed to be in charge of recruitment and deployment of teachers at the primary school level. However, these functions have been centralised in all states, and in practice they are currently carried out by the State Universal Basic Education Boards (SUBEBs). The SUBEBs are the state-based bodies that carry out the mandate of the parastatal Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC), which effectively answers to the Ministry of Education. Among the reasons given for this centralisation, is the need to have high-caliber supervision of the school system and to avoid duplicating structures within

the states in order to conserve funds to be used directly in the schools. The structure of the SUBEBs allows for technical consultations among all the education secretaries of the local governments (there can be up to 44 education secretaries in a state) for input into decision-making at the SUBEBs.

Pakistan

There are no specific written policies in Pakistan for the recruitment and deployment of teachers. However, a devolution plan has been implemented to give more power to district education authorities to make important decisions. This has endowed district governments with certain powers at the local level, including the actual posting of teachers, although the recruitment of teachers and the creation of new posts are still at the provincial level. Multiple tiers of authority exist at the district and provincial level, each with a designation and a set of responsibilities. The most notable ones to mention for the purposes of this study are as follows. At the provincial level, the ultimate authority is the Secretary of Education (SE), who advises on policy issues and is responsible for the implementation and evaluation of plans in the province. Three rungs below the SE is the executive district officer, who plays the crucial role of approving the procurement of goods and the appointment, transfer, promotion, selection and leave of teachers and other education staff. Further down the hierarchy there are other key designations, such as the learning co-ordinator and the president of the School Management Committees, who are responsible for teacher absenteeism, and the Citizen Community Board, which mobilises resources to improve schools and voice community concerns to local governments.

Papua New Guinea

Papua New Guinea is arguably this book's most decentralised case study. Since the introduction of education reform and enactment of the Organic Law on Provincial Government and Local Level Governments, including the Education Act and Teaching Service Act in 1995, PNG has adopted a decentralised teacher deployment system. Education is a decentralised function of provinces, with certain core functions retained by the national department. Teacher deployment, in particular, is carried out at provincial level, with each province recruiting and deploying teachers to schools in each respective province.

Tanzania

The management of primary education in Tanzania is decentralised in the districts. Teachers used to be centrally allocated to the districts from headquarters, but since 2000 districts have been able to hire directly and it is not easy for teachers to transfer from one district to another. The Ministry of Local Government, which manages the districts, is responsible for teacher welfare, while the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT) is responsible for the curriculum, textbook production and other academic matters. This division between two ministries sometimes results in many management problems for district education officers, who must ensure the wellbeing of both teachers and students. The 2002–2006 Primary Education Sector Plan acknowledges the need for increased numbers of teachers in rural areas, and the necessary training and deployment initiatives.

Teacher provision cycle*Teacher education and training*

The supply of qualified and motivated teachers to the education system is one of the most critical components of achieving universal primary education (UPE) and to implementing successful education sector reform. Findings from chapter 2 demonstrated that the supply of qualified teachers overall is slightly short of the requirements for the countries studied. Deployment of the most qualified teachers also favours urban and semi-urban settings. All four countries also showed the need for more female teachers in certain target areas, and particularly in the rural and remote locations. Raising quality standards among teachers is a further concern, and one that must be addressed in both the initial recruitment of new teachers and through in-service development.

PNG: Teacher supply following education reform

Expansion, upgrading and restructuring of education systems are important periods for the appraisal of the effectiveness of teacher education and training policy, and are also necessary for effecting change. In Papua New Guinea, the structural changes of the education system into elementary, primary and secondary education levels – for example, the phasing-out of Grades 1 and 2 from community schools and the establishment of elementary schools with a Prep, E1 and E2 contingent of about 16,000 trained

teachers – has created an enormous pressure on the training of new teachers and re-training of existing teachers.

The Papua New Guinea Education Institute (PNGEI) currently conducts the Certificate of Elementary Teaching (CET), which takes three years for completion through mixed mode. The minimum qualification of entrants to the elementary teacher-training course is Grade 10 formal education; teachers are selected and nominated by their own communities. The training programme has three components: first to attend a workshop that is run at district level during Lahara, the Christmas vacation; second, during the year, teachers are expected to complete a series of self-instructional, self-paced, in-service modules; and third, elementary teachers are visited and supervised by teacher trainers in the classroom.

Since the introduction of elementary schools, teacher recruitment has been carried out by hiring untrained teachers, who are later trained through the donor-funded Elementary Teacher Education Support Project (ETESP). Recruitment of a large number of untrained teachers has raised the question of standard of education in the elementary schools. However, in 2005 about 12,000 teachers were engaged in elementary schools, of which 8,000 had graduated in the CET and the remaining were at different stages of the CET programme.

The critical component of the implementation of education reform in PNG was to offer an opportunity to community school teachers to upgrade their qualification from certificate to diploma level through in-service programmes and through Primary Teachers' Colleges (PTCs) to enable new teachers to qualify for entrance into the reformed curriculum.

From the supply side, the long-term training needs for preparing teachers for teaching Grades 3–8 are being met by seven PTCs. Entry level has increased from Grade 10 to 12, and the duration of the programme has been reduced from three to two years through the introduction of three terms (or the trimester system), which keeps the same teaching time of six semesters. The change has resulted in a decrease of the unit cost of producing a primary teacher and a decrease in enrolment capacity in colleges by 50 per cent. The 2003 PTCs enrolment was:

	<i>Year – 1</i>	<i>Year – 2</i>	<i>Year – 3</i>	<i>Total</i>
Total enrolment	1,154	734	445	2,333
% of female	42%	42%	44%	42%

However, the percentage of female teachers in training remains below that of males, and there is an acute imbalance of gender equity in PTCs.

Only 20 per cent of the teachers employed in these colleges in 2000 were women.

An estimated 10,000 teachers in the field in PNG are without a diploma-level qualification, which is the requirement for teachers to teach in the reformed curriculum. An in-service programme – the Diploma in Education, Primary (In-service) community, known as the DEPI, has been offered since 2002 in PTCs in regional locations through the PNGEI.

Nigeria: Encouraging student teachers into the primary sub-sector

Generally, teacher education fails to attract adequate candidates in Nigeria. This is even more the case for the teachers of primary schools. Students training to become teachers used to have a bursary and scholarship, which encouraged good students to go into teaching. Ukeje (1995) lamented the poor quality of candidates entering into teacher training programmes. Ukeje also noted that the admission of poor-quality candidates is an indictment of the recruitment and preparation processes. Further to this, the reputation and allure of the teaching profession has suffered significantly in recent decades in the country. This is not necessarily an issue isolated to developing countries, as the chronic teacher shortages in parts of the developed world testify to.

Nigeria currently has 83 Nigeria Certificate of Education- (NCE-) awarding institutions, with over 300,000 students – most of whom are females. Twenty of these are Federal Colleges of Education; 41 are owned by state governments; 11 are owned by individuals and faith-based organisations; one is owned by the Nigerian Army; nine are state-owned polytechnics; and there is a federal parastatal, the National Teachers' Institute (NTI), which offers in-service teacher training using open and distance learning methods.

Candidates for admission into a first-degree teacher programme must possess five credit-level passes at the Senior Secondary Certificate Examination (SSCE). Students then spend four years studying methodology, content and practical teaching. By comparison, a candidate for the NCE must possess only three credit-level passes at the SSCE, which must include a pass in English language; he or she will then spend three years in a College of Education (COE).

It should be noted that most students prefer to wait and obtain five credits in SSCE for university admission, rather than taking the NCE in a College of Education, because this may 'sentence' them to teaching at primary school level only. Thus most COEs now admit a large proportion of

their students through the pre-NCE programme. The programme lasts one academic session, and is designed to remedy the deficiency candidates have in their SSCE. The course content is based on the SSCE curriculum. Successful pre-NCE candidates then carry on to study the NCE proper. Initially, the programme was limited to courses like technical education, sciences and languages. With time, the pre-NCE mode of admission has become even more popular than the direct entry mode.

Table 3.1 Distribution of NCE students by mode of entry in 36 sampled Colleges of Education

<i>Year</i>	<i>Total enrolment in NCE1</i>	<i>No. of candidates from pre-NCE</i>	<i>% admitted through pre-NCE</i>
2000/01	17,182	13,860	80.66
2001/02	25,491	17,821	69.91
2002/03	30,638	23,898	78.00
2003/04	31,087	19,409	62.43
2004/05	25,272	20,314	80.38

Source: Primary data collected from COEs (NCCE, 2005).

Beside the general problem of getting fully-qualified students to train as primary school teachers, there are other problems. These include training teachers for special education, with only one College of Education providing training to teachers in this field. It should be noted, however, that all graduates of the NCE are exposed to courses for the identification and treatment of students with special educational needs in the mainstream. There is also the case of teachers for the Nomadic population, which will be treated later in this chapter. The last problem to be mentioned is the case of local language teachers (*beside the three main languages of Hausa, Igbo and Yoruba*). It is very difficult to convince students to study their own language, to teach in it or to teach it to others. To learn or teach in local languages is treated as being very low status, even though studies showed that pupils learn faster if taught in their first languages. There is also the provision of Islamic and Arabic teachers for the Muslim population in the North. Here a suspicion of modern education still exists, which accounts for some of the poorer enrolment ratios and PTRs demonstrated in chapter 2. It is worth noting that the National Commission for Colleges of Education (NCCE) has a curriculum for these teachers, which the colleges in the states populated by Muslims run. However, there are still shortages of qualified teachers in this area.

Pakistan: Negotiating competing challenges of quality and numbers in under-staffed areas

In Pakistan, all primary teachers are expected to complete the Primary Teacher Certificate (PTC) prior to applying for teaching positions. The minimum entry qualification for PTC is matriculation ('matric') or Secondary School Certificate (SSC). The National Education Policy (1998–2010) stipulates raising primary teachers' academic qualification from SSC to Intermediate or Higher Secondary School Certificate (HSSC).

The National Education Policy also talks about launching a new stream of (10+3) Diploma courses for elementary education. It explains that this diploma will enable a teacher to study up to the HSSC level, as well as obtain pedagogical skills for teaching at the primary level. In this way, teachers will be able to receive integrated training both in school subjects as well as pedagogical skills, and will be able to pursue either general studies up to BA-, BSc- and MSc-level or continue to serve the teaching profession.

However, the National Education Policy also talks about relaxing the qualification for appointment where no female teacher is available. This policy is in response to the unavailability of an adequate number of female teachers in some of the remote and rural areas of Pakistan. Thus, as could be seen from table 2.14, female teachers, especially of rural schools, have much lower academic and professional qualifications than male teachers. The majority of female teachers have 'matric' and the PTC, which are minimum teaching qualifications.

In the province of Baluchistan, the minimum qualification for a male teacher is SSC second division with PTC. For female teachers, the condition of PTC is waived. This is because of the scarcity of female teachers in rural areas such as Baluchistan, and because it is very difficult to post a female teacher in a far-flung area or one out of her local residence. As one educational manager (EM) reported:

'Minimum qualification of a primary teacher is SSC second division with PTC for male teacher and for female teacher condition of PTC is removed. The reason for this is that in our rural areas qualified female teachers are less in number. You know that we cannot post a lady teacher to remote areas or out of her local residence.'

In Punjab, there are also some recommendations for relaxing the qualification for female teachers, since it is difficult to find and retain women with high qualifications in rural primary schools.

Nor is the National Education Policy being implemented uniformly in all provinces in Pakistan. The minimum academic qualification of most of

the primary teachers (both male and female) in the province of Sindh is HSSC and the minimum professional qualification is PTC. According to an interview source, a new policy is under consideration in Sindh, according to which the minimum academic qualification of a primary school teacher will be graduation (BA/BSc/BCom). However, the implemented policy is to have an HSSC degree with PTC. The policy of having a graduate degree is now being implemented in the province of Punjab only, where the minimum qualification is a graduate degree with a professional Bachelor of Education (B.Ed) degree. In the North West Frontier Province (NWFP), the minimum qualification is HSSC with PTC, but most of the teachers are graduates.

Tanzania: Challenges of in-service upgrading

In 1977 in Tanzania, teachers were mostly primary school leavers who had been given a short three-month training and posted to the newly-established schools. They were supplemented by an itinerant trainer system based in the local wards. The recruitment of under-qualified people into the Universal Primary Education (UPE) programme in 1977 and the lowering of minimum entrance grades into the profession have been attributed as being major reasons for a decline in the teaching profession in the country. Over the years, teacher training has concentrated on a certificate programme, which enrolled secondary school leavers with 'O' ('ordinary') level passes, runs for three years and offers a two-year training. These certificates are eligible for upgrading to a diploma after working for at least two years and enrolling in another two-year teaching diploma programme. Students completing 'A' ('advanced') levels after sixth form can also enrol in the diploma in education programme, but upon completion these teachers are posted in junior secondary schools to teach forms one and two.

In 2000, the Ministry of Education prepared a Teacher Education Master Plan to raise the status of teachers in general. One large programme in that plan (currently being implemented) is to upgrade the UPE teachers who remain in the lowest Grades C or B into a Grade IIIA category. This requires that they study and obtain 'O' level passes in at least three subjects. While a number have been able to upgrade, many have failed and continue to re-try. Table 3.2, below, shows the success rate in Bunda district, as reported by Maganga (2006).

As table 3.2 indicates, there were no candidates who scored divisions I, II and III; most scored divisions IV and 0, with women teachers' performances being worse than men's. [Division 1 is the highest score, while 0 is a

Table 3.2: Tanzania – Performance of teachers who pursued 'O' level upgrading by sitting for the National Certificate for Secondary Education (NCSE) in Bunda District, 2000-2002

S/No	TRC	# Teachers Took Examination	2000 Exam Results			2001 Exam Results			2002 Exam Results						
			M	F	DIV O	M	F	DIV O	M	F	DIV O				
1.	Balili	50	59	10	5	8	25	9	9	15	7	6	3	10	10
2.	Kung'ombe	20	15	3	1	7	4	8	2	2	8	—	—	—	—
3.	Nyamuswa	40	20	9	4	11	4	15	6	5	6	—	—	—	—
4.	Kibara	18	13	4	1	5	6	2	1	2	2	3	1	2	2
5.	Mwitende	12	9	2	1	4	4	4	1	5	3	—	—	—	—
6.	Mkula	21	12	—	—	—	—	—	2	3	2	4	2	11	5
7.	Nyashimo	97	63	9	4	49	47	6	3	35	20	7	2	12	8
8.	Kiloleli	22	11	0	1	20	10	—	—	—	—	1	0	1	0
9.	Nyalikungu	30	22	10	7	7	3	5	3	3	4	3	3	2	2
10.	Nyanguge	24	11	1	2	2	0	2	0	16	9	0	0	4	0
11.	Kisesa	32	26	20	18	0	2	2	12	3	0	3	—	—	—

Source: Teacher Resource Centre Offices and National Examinations Council of Tanzania (NECTA).

failure]. The total number of teachers in this category in 2000 was 62,000, and since most of them are close to the retirement age of 55, they are waiting to exit the profession. Teachers who upgrade to diploma status prefer to lobby for appointment as inspectors, head teachers or ward education coordinators, which takes them out of school. Current policy is to appoint diploma holders as head teachers, but due to their shortage only urban schools have these individuals as heads. A further concern is the loss of teachers who upgrade to the secondary sector.

Recruitment, placement and transfer

Methods of recruitment and placement have a direct bearing on the equitable distribution of teachers within the education system. Factors that impact on these aspects include the efficiency of the current process, and the appropriateness of various designations of authority in the recruitment and placement process. The extent to which a system is decentralised also impacts – both positively and negatively – on the efficiency of the process. Policy intents are not always translated into effective practice due these factors.

Designations and authority in recruitment and placement

As has been noted, in Nigeria the federal government does not operate primary schools as a matter of policy, while state governments are responsible for recruitment at the secondary level. With the SUBEBs in charge of primary school deployment at the state level, recruitment is based on local government representations. In other words, a quota system is used and within it merit is injected as a critical factor. The main criteria used are the teacher needs of local government education schools.

There is, however, an unwritten practice of unwillingness by states to recruit teachers from other states. This leads to the issue of scarcity in the midst of adequate numbers. This issue is compounded by the accepted dictum that primary school teachers need to speak the local language of the area where they teach, making non-indigenes unwelcome. There is currently a need to recruit around 300,000 qualified teachers nationwide in Nigeria to cover the overall shortage and to replace unqualified teachers in the primary school sector.

Prior to 2006, before the Nigeria Certificate of Education (NCE) was declared to be the minimum teaching qualification, many of states recruited under-qualified and in some cases untrained secondary school leavers to teach. The main reason given for this was lack of finance. These teachers

were paid less than the qualified NCE holders. Of course this practice eventually affected the standard of education at the primary and other levels.

In Pakistan, the devolution process has on the one hand empowered both provincial and district managers with key decision-making powers. However, the district education managers do not have any clear written policy regarding teacher selection and recruitment. A ban on fresh appointments in the early 1990s (with no indication in the National Education Policy Plan 1998–2010 of when it will be lifted) means that new posts cannot be created (MoE, 1998). Posts become available when teachers leave schools for any reason – for example, retirement, death or transfer. When these posts become available, each district invites application for appointments, but the ultimate decision on teacher recruitment still lies at the provincial level, demonstrating another anomaly in the system.

The education managers at the district level make school-specific vacancy statements according to the school's requirements. Every first week of the month, a vacancy statement is sent to the directorate. According to the process of recruitment, the district-level offices only have the authority to place teachers, but do not have the authority to recruit teachers. The exception to this is in Punjab, where teachers are posted and recruited by district offices. In Baluchistan and Sindh, the authority to recruit teachers lies with the education secretary at the provincial level.

In Papua New Guinea, teacher recruitment and placement is also handled at the provincial level, with each province recruiting and deploying teachers to schools in each respective province. Although provincial administrations invite applications for teaching positions from qualified teachers from any part of the country, teachers with a good reputation with a local community receive favourable recommendations from officials such as inspectors and principals and they are usually retained in the same school. Provincial Education Boards (PEBs) screen and select applicants for teaching positions, and deploy teachers to vacant positions within the province. PEBs also receive and consider appeals regarding selection.

While both Pakistan and Nigeria also have systems that are devolved from the centre, there are of course variations. Of the three countries, PNG – perhaps due to its comparatively much small population – is the most advanced in this sense. However, the decentralisation in teacher deployment in PNG brings both benefits and risks. The provincial, district and local-level governments, along with teachers and students, are in a better position to respond quickly and flexibly to needs. This devolved system in some cases helps teachers get more than one offer, sometimes from different

provinces; this is more likely to occur with the best teachers. Once a good teacher declines to accept remote school posting, it is difficult to find a 'good' substitute as so-called good teachers have taken up other postings, mostly in urban locations. Thus, the teachers who were not selected during the first round of recruitment are left with the option of taking up positions in remote schools.

However, weak administrative capacity at the district and local levels in PNG, where there is greater possibility of undue influence being exerted by individuals or groups, may undermine the teacher deployment process (Hallak, 1990). In PNG, where provincial and district administration is highly politicised and cronyism or '*wantokism*'² is often practiced, deployment decisions are prone to abuse.

A recent study in PNG highlighted this concern of a decentralised system:

'In many instances, teacher shortages result from inadequate (and even corrupt) recruitment procedures at the provincial level. Eligible teachers are not being appointed and reasons for non-appointment not being given. For example, in Madang Province in 1999 there were 700 applicants for 916 positions, but only 200 were appointed. In other provinces, despite an average of 2.5 applications for each available position, many eligible teachers are rejected on the grounds that they are, 'suitable but not recommended'. Worse some 'rejected' applicants are appointed instead. Many of the teachers interviewed complained of the "*Wantok*" system (i.e. preference along family, clan or tribal lines)' (GoPNG, and EU, 2001, p.12).

Until 1995, the teacher recruitment policy in Tanzania was based on centralised hiring by the Ministry of Education. In 1996, the system was decentralised and recruitment was transferred to the districts once they had completed their training successfully. However, the entire system of teacher training is currently controlled by the Ministry of Education and Vocational Training (MoEVT), including recruitment of trainees, the development and revision of the teacher education curriculum and materials, and certification and licensing. Licensing is a shared responsibility between the MoEVT and the Teachers' Service Commission. In terms of welfare and promotion, there are specific guidelines issued by the Teachers' Service Commission. The Presidential Commission on Education chaired by the former Minister of Education, Jackson Makwetta, recommended in 1980 the establishment of the Teachers' Service Commission, which is an

extra-ministerial department charged with promotions, pensions, employment and discipline (URT, 1995). This body has branches at all districts, and still functions and is responsible for discussing and recommending promotions and disciplinary actions on primary teachers based in the districts.

Despite the existence of this body and the good work that it does, there are still many complaints of delays in teachers' promotion, disbursement of salaries and pension funds. There is also the problem of the two ministries, the MoEVT and the Local Government Ministry, which runs the district councils and is hence responsible for the salaries of primary school teachers (secondary school teachers' welfare is still largely managed from the MoEVT headquarters). Teachers in remote areas spend long hours travelling to district headquarters, and seldom receive their little pay on time.

Recruiting and placing female teachers

The need for female teachers in rural and remote areas is acknowledged at the national level, but in practice the overall recruitment and placement of female teachers is inevitably biased towards deployment in the urban centres. In Nigeria, the criteria for appointment of candidates to teach are not segregated on the basis of gender, and usually no special consideration is given to any disadvantaged group. In Pakistan, however, a separate vacancy statement for males and females is created, although the deployment of female teachers is almost always limited to familiar local community areas or urban centres, leaving the most remote areas – where indigenous qualified female teachers are far less prevalent – without.

In the northern states of Nigeria, all female qualified teachers who are willing to teach are normally given automatic employment to encourage other females to go to schools, but there is no deployment policy to rural areas. Some states (mainly in the South West) make it a policy to deploy new teachers to rural areas, but young women and married women are usually given preferential posting to urban centres or to areas where their husbands or parents live. Where there are single sex schools, appropriate gender is considered during deployment.

Recruitment and training targeted specifically for women teachers in rural areas is another approach. While Pakistan's National Education Policy does not lay down any specific procedures for selecting teachers, it does present a mechanism for selection according to requirement, and attracting and retaining talented students and rural females in particular in the

Strategies for addressing deployment imbalances:

Targeted training and recruitment

Targeted recruitment to meet teacher shortages in remote and rural schools is rapidly becoming a widely-accepted strategy. Nigeria provides a focused case study of targeted teacher recruitment for addressing one particular community that is in need of more teachers, and more female teachers in particular – nomadic pastoralists. At present, there is no clear written policy for teacher deployment to nomadic schools, although Nigeria has a National Commission for Nomadic Education (NCNE). Teachers are deployed according to the request from the designated schools and the benefiting communities. The major obstacles are: getting the consent of the chairmen of the local government areas concerned, as this secures the funds to pay teachers; and finding qualified teachers that are willing to adapt to the life of the nomads. The same problem is encountered during transfers. It should be noted that there are more transfers out of the nomadic schools, because of the nature and culture of the nomads which non-nomads find hard to bear. This is despite incentives like additional allowances (about 15 per cent of basic salary), means of transport (a free bicycle or motorcycle), mobile accommodation and opportunities for periodic training.

The federal government established a commission to cater for the education of the nomads in 1989 (Act 41 of 1989). The NCNE was charged, among other things:

- i. to integrate the nomads into national life by providing them with relevant and functional education; and
- ii. to upgrade the survival skills of the nomads through improved methods of animal husbandry (Tahir, 1998).

Presently, there are about 1,820 nomadic schools nationwide, with over 350,000 pupils and over 6,000 teachers. The SUBEBs shoulder the responsibility of the employment, deployment and payment of salaries of the nomadic teachers. From reports and discussion with those in charge of the education of the nomads, it is difficult to recruit teachers who can cope with the nature and life of the nomadic people. Staff turnover is very high.

Faced with the above situation, the NCNE along with the UK Department for International Development (DfID) under a Community Education Programme, started a project by identifying young boys and girls among the nomadic communities to be trained as teacher aides at the Federal College of Education, Yola. The programme was later modified for the trainees to obtain Grade II Teachers Certificates. Ninety-five such teachers were trained for the Adamawa and Taraba states. Another set of 125 would be graduating in 2006. However, the change of minimum teaching qualification to NCE poses another challenge. Those teachers that have no NCE must be upgraded. The NCNE is working with the National Teachers' Institute (NTI) and Education Trust Fund (ETF) to achieve this through in-service training.

Stakeholders among the nomads suggested the expansion of the nomadic teacher programme to be offered in more teachers' institutions, so that qualified

graduates with a nomadic background can be sent back to their communities to serve for a minimum period of three years. There is also the suggestion that more permanent grazing reserves should be established, which would make the schools more permanent – even if some of the pupils move, they can carry their records along.

Targeted recruitment has also been a recent, but increasingly prevalent, development in Papua New Guinea. On advice from the provincial Board of Management (BoM), local young people who have the requisite qualifications are recruited to attending teachers training. The newly-recruited trainee teachers are bonded for a minimum of five years to teach in their local schools after completion of teacher training. Given the high rate of unemployment among young people, targeted training is a viable option for addressing two problems: teacher shortages in remote areas and growing unemployment among young school leavers.

One of the important criteria for selection of trainee teachers, apart from the requisite qualification, is their ability to speak a local language and family roots in the locality. The individual trainees who have family connections and roots in the local village, and who live there after completion of school studies, will be more willing to return and remain in the rural environment (Craig, Kraft and du Plessis, 1998).

This strategy is based on the assumption that once the teachers become established within their own village and get married within that village, they will prefer to stay in the same location after the five-year bonding period. In PNG, where law and order is a major problem, teachers also feel more secure living within their communities. In addition, they will get regular help from their extended family, to the extent of producing their own food on their own land. However, the downside of living close to relatives is that there may be too many demands placed on them for financial assistance. Education is also seen as a means of social mobility. PNG communities used to share the cost of the education of their children, with an expectation that those children would become *'bigman'* and bring material benefit for the community. Material demands and attitudes of the community may influence the bonded teacher to leave their local school after five years to seek better opportunities.

It is yet to be seen if targeted recruitment compromises the quality of newly-recruited teachers. It is assumed that given educational opportunities, brighter students continue their studies in colleges and universities after completion of secondary school education. However, school leavers who fail to take advantage of such opportunities usually return to their community, where they are usually considered failures. Thus, this strategy is often not based on merit, but on the availability of a person with the minimum required qualification who is willing to teach in their local school. Nonetheless, given the rapid increase in school leavers due to expansion of high schools and secondary schools, a good number of meritorious students will fail to gain admission in higher education institutions. Gradually, targeted recruitment will become a more merit-based system.

teaching profession. The policy also presents three measures to encourage more female teachers, which are that:

- 70 per cent of newly-established primary schools will be staffed by female teachers; these schools will provide education to both boys and girls;
- during the summer vacation, staggered pre-service training courses will be launched at Primary Teacher Certificate and Certificate of Teaching levels, through which untrained female teachers will be provided with pre-service training; and
- there will be no upper-age restriction for female teachers to join the teaching profession.

However, the extent to which these policies have been implemented has been difficult to measure within the research limitations of this study.

Transfers

In Nigeria, transfers are done periodically to move teachers according to needs. However, some transfers take place on request – such as the transfer of a wife when her spouse is moved, or on disciplinary grounds. The abuse of transfer policies can arguably occur within most systems, and nepotism and corruption can be instrumental in ensuring that teachers in undesirable remote or rural areas are transferred out. Overall, the transfer of teachers is a complex aspect of the deployment cycle. While it is preferred that transferring teachers be kept to a minimum for reasons of stability, transfers also provide an opportunity to address disparities in teacher provision within a country.

In Pakistan, this duality was observed, and there is a conflict between policy and practice. With regards to primary teachers' transfers, the National Education Policy (1998–2010) in the country clearly states that: 'teachers shall be assigned to schools on the basis of empirical need and the transfer rate shall be reduced by recruiting local teachers for schools' (MoE, 1998, p.29). This policy aims to reduce teacher transfer by deploying local teachers to schools on the basis of those schools' needs. However, a reduction in the teacher transfer rate has not been observed in practice. In fact, the issue of teacher shortages in some schools and surpluses in others is actually being addressed through teacher transfers.

The district governments in Pakistan have the authority to transfer Grade 1 to Grade 16-level teachers. With this authority, district govern-

ments are able to better place teachers according to schools' needs and requirements. Based on the process of needs assessment, teachers can be transferred from schools where they are in surplus to schools where they are in shortage. The National Education Policy (1998–2010) clearly states that in this manner: 'better distribution and optimum utilisation of teachers shall be ensured. The teaching force shall be redeployed from schools where there is a surplus to schools where there is a shortage' (MoE, 1998, p.30). So the devolved system has the potential to resolve uneven deployment, but will take time and at the time of writing still varied across districts. As one education manager disclosed:

'So, wherever we have a shortage we shift people accordingly, but the process is quite difficult. Teachers from urban areas are not willing to work in rural areas. Even they do not wish to be transferred from one Union Council to another Union Council. And for that they use different sources and political pressures to provide hindrances in the way of their transfers.'

Forced deployment

Forced deployment is a strategy that has several barriers to working successfully. In order to be fully implemented, the system of deployment would need to be a relatively centralised one and this is not necessarily the most conducive system for ensuring local-level responses are met. On the surface, forced deployment is a straightforward approach that, if executed effectively, should allow planners to fill the necessary understaffed areas with teachers. However, the policy produces complex consequences.

In Nigeria some states – mainly in the South West – make it a policy to deploy new teachers to rural areas. While this may bolster overall numbers to understaffed regions, the immediate consequence of this strategy of course is that rural and remote areas receive the least experienced teachers, thus perpetuating the disparity in quality. Such strategies are also arguably instrumental in making the public teaching profession undesirable to graduates. Ultimately, the success of such a system would depend on very careful management (Mulkeen, 2005).

Forced deployment has been a regular practice in Papua New Guinea, with mixed success. While this strategy is essential to meet the staffing needs of remote schools, it is detrimental to teachers' morale and ultimately can affect the quality of teaching. When teachers are strongly encouraged or forced to take up teaching positions in remote locations, they may leave teaching to look for alternative employment. Alternatively, some teachers hang around the provincial administration in the hope of get a better

Strategies for addressing deployment imbalances:

Teacher incentives – salaries, stipends and allowances

Teacher incentives are a necessary policy approach that countries have yet to fully appreciate in practice. As noted earlier, teacher reluctance to be placed in rural and remote locations remains a key factor in both the unequal distribution of teachers nationally, but also in the overall appeal of the teaching profession. This is more the case in countries like the four case studies, where rural life still predominates. Nor is teacher dissatisfaction a new phenomenon. Since 1980, studies conducted locally in Tanzania, for example, have revealed that poor motivation is a serious issue in the profession. Mwakilembe (1981) and Mwolontalima (1981) showed teacher dissatisfaction based on their low salaries and low social status – which used to be much higher prior to 1968. More recently, large numbers of teachers remain in their jobs, but try to supplement their low pay by running small gardens, animal husbandry and other ‘backyard’ projects or small businesses (Katunzi, 1995). The need for such extra-work activities are not only a disincentive for teachers to enter the profession – particularly in the rural areas where pay is generally lower and irregular – but can also contribute to the major issue of teacher absenteeism.

In Nigeria, teachers in nomadic areas have been provided with an additional allowance (about 15 per cent of the basic salary). Meanwhile the National Education Policy (1998-2010) in Pakistan also talks about a stipend scheme to be started for studies at the intermediate and degree levels, whereby the students receiving the stipend will be contracted to join the teaching profession on the completion of their studies. Those receiving higher qualifications during their service will be given adequate incentives of advance increments, as well as rapid promotion within their cadres so as to retain them in the profession.

Pakistan’s National Education Policy chalks out various incentives for providing a suitable number of trained teachers to disadvantaged institutions. These are:

- a) providing a stipend to female students at school and college levels, and then contracting them to serve specific institutions for a period of three to five years; and
- b) providing incentives in terms of special pay and allowances for working in far-flung rural institutions.

Data in Pakistan suggest there has been no raise in teachers’ salaries for those deployed in remote rural areas. This means that the National Policy directive of providing incentives such as special pay and allowances for working in remote rural institutions is not being implemented. As one education manager disclosed: ‘A teacher who is being deployed to a far-flung area is receiving only about Rs.4,000 salary. How can he/she support his/her children and live a decent life?’

The government in Papua New Guinea has also attempted to make working in disadvantaged schools more attractive through the use of incentives. A system of allowances for those working in such schools has increased to K1000.00 per teacher, per year; this is equivalent to approximately 10 per cent of a primary school

teacher's salary. This allowance is paid to compensate for teachers' additional transport costs, and hardships they face while living in remote and isolated locations. However, the amount is generally acknowledged to be too small to encourage qualified teachers to take up positions in disadvantaged schools. In most cases, the allowance is only a fraction of the additional transport costs for cashing the fortnightly salary cheque, travelling for medical treatment and visiting family. A general complaint against the DoE administration in PNG is to do with non-payment and late payment of the disadvantaged school allowance to teachers. The country's National Education Plan 2005-2014 (NDOE, 2004) calls for a review of remote and disadvantaged schools for the purpose of attracting a disadvantaged school allowance. There will also be enhanced incentives to attract teachers to remote areas.

posting; if unsuccessful, they move to the remote posting a few months after the school year commences.

Another detrimental aspect is the use of forced deployment as a system of punishment (Mulkeen, 2005). This system may not work, because relocating misbehaving teachers to remote location carries the risk of less supervision and more trouble for the schools. For example, if teachers are sent to remote locations for disciplinary reasons, the chances of them becoming more troublesome are great because of the lack of supervisory visits by inspectors.

Forced deployment alone is further complicated as a strategy, because it is clear that in all four case studies female teachers cannot for various reasons be a part of such a systematic approach (reasons that include security and cultural factors, such as women being expected to not move too far from their locales). Such constraints make this strategy very difficult to implement. Ultimately, teachers working in remote locations for several years deserve to be recognised and rewarded for serving in difficult conditions, and it is perhaps only with this in mind that any approach of systematic forced deployment to remote and rural areas can be successful. It would be useful to consider a system where a condition for teaching in urban schools, and even promotions, is based on an individual's service in remote areas. Strategies that help to provide a more conducive environment for hosting teachers are also needed.

Teachers on short-term contracts

Teachers are also being recruited on contracts. In Pakistan, this happens at the district level. Two reasons have been shared for contractual

Strategies for addressing deployment imbalances:

Teacher incentives – housing and travel

A second major incentive for teachers to relocate to remote schools is the provision of housing for teachers. Teachers who live far away from a school are likely to spend considerable time walking to and from that school, often arriving late and leaving early. This has implications for the amount of quality time teachers spend preparing lessons. Moreover, there is a strong association between the availability of housing and female teachers.

In Nigeria, the policy approach to travel barriers was similar to that adopted as an incentive for teachers in nomadic areas, that is through the provision of free bicycles and motorcycles. In Pakistan, the National Education Policy has tried to use incentives for alleviating the difficulties of travel to key facilities. Apart from extending residential facilities, daily commuter services to remote institutions are also mentioned in the Policy, as are the opening of day care centres near the schools for women teachers' dependents. Besides these measures, retired personnel may also be engaged to teach in these institutions until regular staff is attracted to serve these institutions through various programmes of incentives.

In PNG, development and maintenance of infrastructure such as teachers' housing is the responsibility of the LLGs and BoMs. Annual budgetary support to schools for infrastructure development and maintenance are usually inadequate or in some cases almost not available to build new houses or to maintain existing ones. A European Union-funded project has now targeted school infrastructure development, including teachers' houses in disadvantaged and remote schools. The project is showing promising results in terms of attracting young, trained teachers to disadvantaged schools. Although good-quality housing for teachers is a significant incentive for teachers, and essential for female teachers, it is very expensive for the government to provide. Increasingly, however, the wider community is becoming more conscious of their children's education. Parents and community members are taking initiatives to use local resources to build houses to attract and retain quality teachers in local schools. Although these are both good initiatives, the task is too big to provide housing in all disadvantaged schools.

In Tanzania, teachers are supposed to get housing at the school where they are working. Even in the recent Primary Education Development Programme (PEDP), newly built schools are encouraged to also build houses for teachers. This is done faster in better-off districts and more slowly in poorer districts. Moreover, the houses so built belong to the schools and not the teachers. There is no arrangement yet for teachers to borrow money in order to build their own houses. Thus after retirement, many teachers who have not used their own initiative find themselves homeless or living in very poor conditions. Regarding transport, no policy exists to assist teachers in Tanzania – even to acquire bicycles on a loan basis. Recently, a credit and saving co-operative movement has begun helping many employees and teachers to form similar saving movements in districts.

recruitment, the main one being to attract talented people into the profession to improve the quality of education. The second reason, which is more disturbing, is to cut the costs of employing teachers – since pensions and other benefits do not have to be paid if they are employed on short-term contracts.

The teachers recruited on contracts in Pakistan are being posted in schools where teachers are required, at least in Sindh and Punjab. The practice is then to confirm the appointment of those contractual teachers who produce good results. This means that contract teachers who perform well are absorbed into the system as permanent teachers.

Nigeria also hosts a category of teachers who are recruited by the primary teaching authorities to fill gaps. Usually these groups of teachers are employed on a temporary or part-time basis³. They tend not to be reliable and present problems of continuity and quality in many instances.

Teacher utilisation as a compensatory alternative

Innovative practices in teacher utilisation such as multigrade and shift teaching have been developed in some countries as a compensatory strategy for managing the teacher shortages that exist in rural areas. The place of these approaches within this book is interesting, as they do not represent an actual teacher-deployment strategy in themselves. In the absence of effective teacher deployment, there is no doubt that they are useful innovations, and multigrade in particular has unique pedagogical benefits. However, it is important to analyse in what contexts they can be used as remedial and appropriate alternatives in areas where there is a short supply of teachers.

Villages in Papua New Guinea are characterised by their small populations and are geographically dispersed and isolated, often separated by long distances of valleys, mountains, rivers and seas. Average rural primary schools have up to 100–150 students, compared with an average of 500 students in urban schools. Distance is the major factor affecting children's attendance at school. Enrolment in rural schools falls off very rapidly the longer the distance children have to travel to school (World Bank, 2004). Enrolments in rural schools also fluctuate between years and within years depending on the distance of schools from catchment areas, social instability, weather patterns and seasonal farming activities.

Rural schools are characterised by small enrolments and one teacher per class. The problem with not enough teachers taking up rural positions means that many positions remain unfilled for months, and even whole terms or years.

**Strategies for addressing deployment imbalances:
Continuing professional development**

Teachers in remote and rural locations are at a distinct disadvantage in the pursuance of professional development throughout their careers. A teacher posted to such an area for an extended period of time runs the risk of not receiving regular promotion like his or her colleagues, and would rarely be sponsored for workshops or conferences. Even where there are avenues for upgrading professionally, such teachers can seldom afford to pay or get sponsorship from employers. As a result, it is possible to find teachers in rural locations who have not attended any refresher course years after qualification.

The geographical difficulty of providing continuing professional development (CPD) to teachers in rural and remote locations has required the use of innovative approaches. Nigeria provides courses for upgrading mounted by the National Teachers' Institute (NTI), colleges and faculties of education. With the new policy of the Nigeria Certificate of Education (NCE) being the minimum teaching qualification, the NTI has intensified retraining programmes by distance learning as a means of reaching teachers in removed locations. Currently, there are over 100,000 teachers undergoing NCE/Distance Learning System (NTI Annual Report, 2005).

The federal government established the Teachers Registration Council of Nigeria (TRCN) in 1993, among others, to control and regulate teacher education, training and practices at all levels in order to match teacher quality, discipline, professionalism, reward and dignity with international standards. The Council intends to promote effective teacher registration and licensing, monitor their training and mandatory professional development, and to maintain discipline among practitioners. Its mandate covers the whole country. At the time of writing (2006) the TRCN was due to start prosecuting unqualified teachers. It is hoped that the quality of teachers will improve very soon.

Teachers in Nigeria also have a central union – the Nigeria Union of Teachers (NUT) – with state branches. Although it uses strikes, works-to-rule and demonstrations to get its demands, it has also started to collaborate with subject associations to give its members avenues to acquire more knowledge. For example, it has a working relationship with associations like the Science Teachers' Association of Nigeria and the Mathematical Association of Nigeria.

In Tanzania, the lowest cadre of teachers is the grade B/C, which includes primary school leavers who have undergone a certificate course of between one and three years and are licensed teachers. The current policy since the Teacher Education Master-plan (TEMP) of 2000 is to upgrade all grade C teachers (ex-primary school leavers) to B through provision of secondary education up to junior secondary 'O' level. Most of the 62,000 grade C teachers who existed in 2000 have studied and passed at least three 'O'-level subjects and received the certificate of secondary education 'O' level.

The PNG National Teacher In-service Plan (2007–2014) reaffirmed that: 'finding the best models for professional development is one of the serious, unresolved problems of educational research' (Elliot, 2005). The primary focus of the Teacher

In-service Plan is teachers in ongoing employment, and competence to adopt curriculum reforms in programming, content, teaching methodologies and assessment. Among numerous stakeholders, the Plan emphasises the leading role of teachers as education providers and to support the successful implementation of the In-service Plan. This will require Primary Teachers' Colleges (PTCs) and others to reflect, in their programmes and practices, the focus of the current curriculum reform and to develop the capacity to accommodate the changes needed. Given that most of the current in-service training in Papua New Guinea is funded by donors, there is however, a question of the sustainability of the programme.

The PNG National Education Plan (NEP) emphasises the need to strengthen and expand the provision of teacher training, including in-service training through flexible delivery mechanisms. This appears to be a rational move to meet the enormous training needs for primary teachers. However, the capacity of open and distance learning (ODL) in PNG is very limited and needs substantial investment to develop capacity in developing self-instructional materials and delivering programmes. Current initiatives of ODL providers, including the PNG Education Institute (PNGEI) and the Papua New Guinea Association for Distance Education (PNGADE), need strong support from the government and donors to engage meaningfully in teacher professional upgrading.

In order to address the above issues, the National Department of Education (NDOE) has introduced a policy of allocating teachers to schools on the basis of enrolments, rather than the number of grades or classes, leading effectively to a system of multigrade teaching. The National Education Plan (NEP) 2005–2014 (NDOE, 2004) recommended a staff-student ratio of 1:37 during the plan period. The Plan also emphasises the institutionalisation of multigrade teaching. Multigrade teaching, popularly known as composite classes, was common in PNG during the 1960s as a strategy for allowing an annual intake and increasing access. The system was phased out in the 1970s following independence: 'This was because the primary teaching force was localised and the teacher educators at the time deemed it wise that Papua New Guineans should not be asked to deal with any more than one class group at a time' (NDOE, 2002, p.15). The phasing out of multigrade teaching was mainly due to the capability of the then primary teachers to teach more than one grade because, in 1975, Grade 8 was the entry level for teacher training. The other reasons for its phasing out were:

- teachers did not like the system, because it took more commitment and work;
- head teachers did not promote it due to the possibility of the downgrading of his/her school;

- communities did not accept it, because the status of their school was diminished; and
- administrators avoided multigrade teaching because of its complicated administration.

The initiative to institutionalise multigrade teaching in PNG is supported by the introduction of a multigrade teaching allowance, equivalent to 10 per cent of gross salary, and provision of in-service courses for multigrade teachers. A study (Guy et al, 2003) of selected rural and urban primary schools in eight provinces covering four regions of the country, found that of the total 1,752 teachers, only 216 (12 per cent) were teaching 28 different combinations of multigrade classes in 2002. There were some unusual combinations, but these were the results of staggered intakes in largely one-teacher or two-teacher schools.

Despite the phasing-out of multigrade in PNG in the 1970s, due to its unique conditions of very small student populations (e.g. schools with 40 students) the approach can be viable and perhaps more practical overall. Multigrade teaching as a pedagogical approach also has an appeal in increasing performance and abilities among children. The existence of teachers in remote locations with multigrade skills is certainly an advantage, as this can be of use to cover teacher absenteeism due to ill-health (Mulkeen, 2005). However, more generally in the case of remote locations with high PTRs, multigrade as a concerted approach cannot be viewed as a strategy to be prioritised above the need for increased teacher numbers and strategies that seek to directly address the deployment imbalances in disadvantaged areas, such as targeted education and recruitment.

The Tanzanian PEDP 2002–2006 specifies quite clearly that although the ideal standard teacher-pupil ratio is 1:45, ‘in practice, some schools will need to function with a morning session and an afternoon session for several years’. Research conducted in Morogoro Region showed some interesting perspectives on the implementation of this policy (Davidson, 2004), with double-shift systems being used in the majority of schools visited. However, while class sizes were reduced, there was a compromise on quality, with timetables having to be re-written and fewer periods per week. Double shifts were also very unpopular with teachers, for reasons similar to the discontent displayed by teachers regarding multigrade in PNG. Moreover, Davidson’s research displayed crucial evidence that although the PEDP had made budgetary provision for incentives to teachers who were required to teach double shifts, these were not being delivered in practice.

Myriad experiences and challenges

Investigations into policies and practices in the four case study countries have demonstrated that all four have decentralised education management systems to varying degrees. Of the four, Nigeria is arguably the least devolved, although the very nature of its federated system means that while there is a separation of authority from the federal ministry by each of the individual state governments, further devolution to local level governments has yet to be achieved (in practice at least). Additionally, the existence of the parastatal Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC), which effectively delegates matters pertaining to basic education through the State Universal Basic Education Boards (SUBEBs), further complicates the line of decentralisation.

Pakistan, Tanzania and Papua New Guinea have all legislated for decentralisation of their education systems down to the district levels. In practice, difficulties persist due to multiple layers of authority and responsibilities that have convoluted the efficiency of the teacher deployment cycle. In Pakistan, this is manifested in limited power at the district level to recruit, which is still held at the more centralised provincial level (although districts do have the power to place). In Tanzania, the existence of two ministries has created some conflict, although their responsibilities do not cross over on the teacher deployment issue as much. PNG – perhaps the most devolved case study – demonstrates one of the side effects of devolution without effective safeguards – nepotism; this is in turn having a disparate impact on teacher deployment.

Teacher education is a key aspect of ensuring sufficient newly-qualified teachers enter the system, and of providing in-service teachers with the opportunity of upgrading their skills. PNG demonstrates teacher education policies implemented following the restructuring of an education system and subsequent teacher supply shortages. Nigeria provides a classic example of the difficulties faced in encouraging student teachers to choose the primary sub-sector as a preferred career route, and Pakistan demonstrates the challenges of ensuring adequately trained teachers that meet the expected national certification, without losing numbers. Tanzania's attempts at in-service upgrading in a rural district were also observed.

Recruitment and placement of teachers are processes that are reliant on effective decentralised systems, without the overlaps in authority or nepotism already mentioned. Successful approaches potentially include well-planned, targeted training and recruitment, and teacher incentives that tackle the challenges of poor/untimely pay, housing and travel

considerations. Intrinsically these approaches also address gender considerations, although overall the research did not uncover any major current policies or practices within the institutional frameworks that can assist in redressing the imbalance between male and female teachers in rural areas. Teachers on short-term contracts can provide manpower when needed – especially in the absence of clear authority to recruit new teachers – but also create issues of quality.

Transfers as a remedial approach to deployment imbalances were witnessed in Pakistan, contrary to the government policy that stated it wanted to minimise the disruption of transfers. As a long-term approach transfers are problematic, because they create destabilised systems. In many cases redeployment would carry the same provisos as forced deployment, and this was found to be ineffective in PNG as a strategy for addressing deployment imbalances. Arguably, for such policies to work in practice, a joint strategy of teacher incentives to accompany them is needed.

The myriad experiences and challenges inherent in the policy and implementation of teacher deployment have been explored to some extent in this chapter, along with some of key approaches needed for tackling those challenges. The following chapter seeks to formulate recommendations in this regard from the cumulative lessons learnt from the four case studies.

Notes

- 1 However, the federal government will continue to run federal government colleges (102 of them) at the senior secondary level. Currently, it recruits teachers (*mainly graduates of universities*) and deploys them to the schools. Recruited federal teachers can be deployed to any part of the country and can be transferred at will by the Federal Ministry of Education. State governments recruit teachers for their secondary schools mainly through the State Ministries of Education or Teaching Service Commission (TESCOM).
- 2 '*Wantokism*' is a Melanesian pidgin. '*Wan*' means 'same' or 'similar' or sometimes 'a common link'; while *Tok* means 'talk'. In an urban context, *Wantok* means people who come from same clan, tribe or district, even though they may not talk same language.
- 3 There are also teachers who are under the employment of private or faith-based organisations. They have a different scheme of service, and are usually treated differently from public service teachers.

