

3

Gathering and Using Gender-Sensitive Indicators

This section examines a number of key areas for gender-sensitive indicators at the national level:

- 1 Population composition and change
- 2 Human settlements and geographical distribution
- 3 Households and families, marital status, fertility
- 4 Learning in formal and non-formal education
- 5 Health, health services, nutrition
- 6 Economic activity and labour force participation
- 7 Access to land, equipment and credit
- 8 Legal rights and political power
- 9 Violence against women
- 10 Macroeconomic policy and gender

These areas cover some of the most important indicators to be collected at the national level. They have been identified as international priorities in UN recommendations (UN 1995a; 1990; 1989; UNDP, 1995) and the Beijing Platform for Action (1995). The material in this section also draws from CIDA (1996a) and Commonwealth Secretariat (1996). UN (1990a) also provides listings of indicators under each of these classifications. These listings are reproduced in the Appendix. The following tables are indicative or a checklist, in that they provide broad guidelines within which specific indicators should be generated. The tables should be adapted for use by governments depending on the local context.

In addition to suggesting indicators, the tables also provide related indicator questions which deal with broader socio-economic questions related to the topic and to gender relations at the national level. The indicators noted in the first column of the tables are basic indicators which should be collected routinely in order to develop a basic database on questions of gender equity. The indicator questions complement the indicators by asking the kinds of questions that are usually addressed during gender analysis. Dealing with broader socioeconomic areas, these indicator questions ask why the situation that the indicator describes has come into being, what it tells us about gender relations, and how this situation can be changed. The indicators and indicator questions should therefore be read together, with the indicator questions being questions that need to be answered in the generation and analysis of gender-sensitive indicators.

Population Composition and Change¹

Indicators of population composition and change are important in determining the process of social and economic development in a country and hence for the planning of development policies. All such data should be collected on a sex-disaggregated basis. Collection and use of population composition indicators can assist with the prediction of the potential demand for and use of social and

other services in a gendered fashion. For example, a greater percentage of women under 15 in one region may identify the need for particular kinds of services relevant to younger women.

Population composition and change data is usually available from the national census and special studies.

Table 1 **Population Composition and Change**

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 Size of the population by sex, total and % under 15	♦ What is the sex ratio in the country? Is there a reverse sex ratio? Does this vary by region?
2 Sex ratio (number of females to males)	♦ If there is a reverse sex ratio, what are the reasons for this? What are the means of changing this situation and how can women and men be involved in these changes?
3 Births and deaths by sex (numbers and rates per 1,000), annually	♦ Does international and internal migration vary by sex? If this is the case, what are the reasons for this variation?
4 Net international migration rates by sex	♦ Do migration patterns at regional and national levels adversely affect women? If this is the case, how can this situation change and what input can women and men make to these changes?
5 Net internal migration rates by sex	

Two of the most important sets of indicators under this heading relate to the sex ratio and migration. The 'normal' sex ratio is approximately 1:1, or one woman to one man. However, economists using population composition data from national censuses have shown that in some parts of Asia the sex ratio is strongly biased against women (Dreze and Sen, 1989). The sex ratio is therefore a useful diagnostic indicator which can point to gender biases in a given country, and the reasons for these biases can be explored using gender analysis. The sex ratio can also be used as a measure of the movement of women towards full equality and equity. If population composition is collected by socio-economic group, then estimates can be made of the differential position of women by such a grouping. However, data is not always available by sex to enable the measurement of the sex ratio.

Migration is important in terms of gender because of the impact that both international and internal migration can have on the household, and because of opportunities that migration can offer to women. This impact is felt both when men migrate and women continue to work in the household, and when women themselves choose to migrate. Migrant women in particular are, however, often a disadvantaged group as they usually have little education or socially valued job skills, and have to adjust to a new environment.

Human Settlements and Geographical Distribution

Recently there have been serious concerns expressed about the conditions in which people, and particularly women, are living. The generation of socioeconomic and

demographic indicators by geographical area can be used to differentiate between living conditions in specified areas and to develop policies for reducing disparities. Indicators of housing conditions and facilities available to households reveal where poor housing conditions, and insufficient water and energy supplies, impact most heavily on women as the main providers of reproductive labour in many countries.

Table 2 Human Settlements and Geographical Distribution

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 Number, % distribution and density of population by sex, geographical area and urban/rural	♦ Is there a pattern of concentration of women and men in particular regions or in urban or rural areas as a result of migration or other factors? If so, does this impact negatively on women? Is there discrimination against rural women and if so, what policies can be implemented to reverse this situation?
2 Degree of discrimination against rural women: Rural and urban mortality rates, life expectancy and nutritional status	♦ Do the characteristics of housing differ by male- and female-headed household? Are living conditions worse for female-headed households, and by what degree? How can policy improve this situation?
3 Stock and characteristics of housing (materials used in construction of outer walls, floors and roofs; number of rooms; kitchen and bathroom facilities; availability of water and bathroom facilities), by region and by female- and male-headed households	♦ Are there constitutional, legal or administrative impediments to women's access to and ownership of land and housing?
4 Tenure of household, by region and by female- and male-headed households	♦ Is there gender bias between different kinds of households concerning energy consumption? If so, how does this affect women? How can policy improve the situation?
5 Domestic household energy consumption by region and by female- and male- headed households	♦ Are women spending more time on household-related activities than men? If so, what are the implications for gender relations within the household and how can these relations be made more equal by policy intervention?
6 Time-use in connection with household activities (collection of water, fuel, food), by region and by female- and male-headed households	

It should be noted that human settlements and geographical distribution indicators are among the indicators least amenable to differentiation by sex. One means of making these indicators more gender-sensitive is to disaggregate data by female and male head of household in order to establish if female-headed households are discriminated against in terms of housing conditions and access to facilities. If the definition of the term 'female-headed households' by governments is internationally comparable, then comparison could be made across countries to provide an international picture of the relative status of female-headed households.

One key element of CEDAW (see Section 2) is to report on discrimination against rural women, and collecting data on geographical distribution will enable such reporting. Much of the information on human settlements and geographical distribution is available in population censuses and from time-use surveys.

Households and Families, Marital Status, Fertility

The position of women within the household or family is often a key element in relation to gender inequality and to women's participation in society as a whole. Defining the household or family in such a way as to allow for the variety of living arrangements is complex, but flexible definitions of household and family will facilitate a greater understanding of women's role as well as the distribution of intra-household resources. A wider definition of the household which recognises women's role and does not presume that the household is a single co-operative unit has been a key lobbying point for women's organisations over the last decade (Nelson, 1996). It is particularly important to define the concept of 'household head' in a fashion which recognises the role played by many women as main household provider.

The main sources of data in this area are censuses and demographic surveys.

Table 3 **Households and Families, Marital Status, Fertility**

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 Number and % distribution of households	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ♦ How is household head defined? Is the definition broad enough to include women's role within the household? ♦ What is the significance of the extent of male/female heads of household? Are more female-headed households poor, and if so, what are the reasons for this? ♦ Do women and men living in the same household as a married couple or otherwise have the same rights and responsibilities? ♦ Is divorce available to men and women on the same grounds? ♦ How are household decisions made concerning the number and spacing of children?
2 % distribution of population in households by size	
3 % of households headed by women/men	
4 % of poor households headed by women/men	
5 Crude birth rate, per 1,000 women in specified age group²	

Learning in Formal and Non-Formal Education

Education indicators are among the most important for measuring the status of women and gender equity, and one of the better reported areas, mainly in censuses and administrative records. Educational indicators can also be found in UNESCO's *Statistical Yearbooks*. Several international studies have also focused recently on the key role education of the girl child and women can play in improving women's status (World Bank, 1995b).

With regard to education indicators, two main sectors have been distinguished, and when developing a national level database this typology can be used. The first sector relates to indicators of educational characteristics of the population, including literacy, educational attainment, access to education and school attendance. The second relates to indicators of the educational system, including enrolment, retention, educational resources and curricula.

Even in areas where data collection is better developed there are often differing views as to which indicators best reflect gender inequity. Developing education indicators also shows that the use of gender-sensitive indicators involves trade-offs of various kinds, for example between accuracy of data and relevance to women. Enrolment

rates, which, along with literacy, are among the education indicators most commonly used to measure the status of women, are a good example of this.³

The standard enrolment indicator, *the number of children enrolled in primary or secondary school as a percentage of total number of children in the relevant age group for that level*, otherwise known as ‘gross enrolment’, is problematic because it assumes an orderly and simple relationship between age group and level of education. “In many countries, the figures for primary school enrolment in fact reach more than 100 per cent, because many children of secondary school age attend primary school” (Anderson, 1991: 56). Anderson suggests instead as an indicator *net enrolment ratios showing the total number of children enrolled in a schooling level who belong to the relevant age group*, expressed as a percentage of the total number of children in that age group, otherwise known as ‘net enrolment’. Anderson also suggests that the net enrolment ratio for primary schools is the most suitable educational indicator, as secondary school net enrolment ratios may reflect whether or not a country has a compulsory stage of secondary education (1991: 56).

Table 4 Education

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 Numbers and percentages of literate persons, by sex and age	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◆ Is there equal access to education in practice? If not, which factors cause differential access to education by women and men? If there is discrimination, how can this be changed and how can women and men take part in this process of change? ◆ What uses do women and men make of their education? Does the social context allow women to make full use of their education? ◆ Do women and men enrol in university subjects according to gender stereotypes? Can the government intervene to challenge such gender stereotyping? ◆ Are women and men stereotyped in school curricula? How can these curricula be changed to eliminate gender stereotyping and present in a positive light women, men and gender relations? ◆ Have legislative or other measures been taken to ensure equal access to education for women and men?
2 Years of schooling completed, by level and sex	
3 Access to specialised training programmes (vocational, technical and professional) at the secondary level and above, by sex	
4 % of women/men graduating in the fields of law/sciences/medicine	
5 Gross primary and secondary school enrolment ratio for girls/boys	
6 Enrolment ratios of women and men in tertiary education and university	
7 Female/male dropout rates at primary, secondary and tertiary levels	
8 % of female/male teachers at primary, secondary and tertiary levels	
9 % of female/male school principals and university heads of departments	

One problem with net enrolment ratios is that data for them may be less readily accessible than for gross enrolment rates. In addition:

“Although enrolment rates may be associated with literacy levels among girls and may be used as current bench-marks so that future progress may be measured, enrolment at the elementary level is not the most significant figure. In societies where parents feel it is

important to invest in the education of boys but not girls, it is likely that few girls will attain secondary levels of education, let alone a university education. Thus, it is important to obtain not only enrolment statistics, but to obtain enrolment statistics by level, and, at the higher levels, by the field of study, which may indicate the different types of educational pyramids which exist for girls and boys and also the changes in the shape of the pyramids over time."

UN, 1984a: 35

The trade-off involved in choosing one or the other of the indicators above is illustrated in Figure 1, which puts the indicators into high or low categories. It is apparent from the figure that there is no perfect indicator to measure gendered enrolment.

Figure 1 Strengths and Weaknesses of Educational Indicators from a Gender Perspective

Indicator	Relevance to Women	Availability of Data	Precision of Measurement
Gross enrolment at primary level	Low	High	Low
Gross enrolment at secondary level	High	High	Low
Net enrolment at primary level	Low	Low	High
Net enrolment at secondary level	High	Low	High

There are three further points to make about enrolment ratios:

- 1 Enrolment ratios reveal how many people enrol but not how many attend. "Because censuses do not provide data which permit an examination of absences and dropouts, except by inference over long periods, it is important to supplement census data with other material which will provide information on this pattern of attendance" (UN, 1984a: 35). However, data on dropout rates for developing countries is not readily accessible.
- 2 Enrolment ratios do not cover the qualitative area of the make-up of the curriculum. "Even when girls are attending school, they may be experiencing a very different type of educational training than are boys. In many societies the curriculum deemed appropriate for girls may be totally unrelated to potential later employment" (UN 1984a: 36). One of the key areas raised at international fora has been gender stereotyping within school and university curricula. This is a complex area and it is difficult to narrow down into specific indicators. School and university curricula should therefore be examined through the use of special studies and surveys to determine their gender content.
- 3 Enrolment ratios are indicators of process rather than of outcome. Outcome indicators can be literacy rates, and these are usually considered more significant than enrolment ratios because they represent the outcome of schooling. However, there is also a trade off in the choice of indicators of literacy. Basic literacy rates, as defined by UNESCO, measure the ability to both read and write a short simple statement on one's everyday life. Some documents (e.g., UN, 1989) suggest that functional literacy (i.e. the ability to read a newspaper) is a better outcome indicator; however, functional literacy rates are not usually collected for developing countries.

There are also constraints with the use of literacy as an indicator. Literacy reflects the functioning of the education system over a number of years. “The average age of the developing world population over 15 is 36, therefore adult education measures reflect the average social effort for education about 20 to 35 years ago ... Such prevalence measures are relatively insensitive to the current social investment in educating youth” (Murray, 1993: 46).

Table 5 **Health, Health Services, Nutrition**

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 % of government expenditure devoted to women's health needs in a) productive and b) non-productive areas	♦ Are women and girls discriminated against in terms of access to health care? If so, what are the reasons for this and how can this discrimination be overcome?
2 Number of/access to primary health care centres by sex	♦ What % of health personnel are women, at the different levels of the health system?
3 Number of visits to and number of bed-nights spent in hospital by women/men; number of hospital beds as % of population	♦ If mortality and morbidity rates differ between men and women, what is the reason for this? What are the major causes of infant and child morbidity in girls and boys?
4 Proportion of girls and boys immunised against specific diseases	♦ What cultural and other obstacles are there to women and girls receiving health care and family planning services?
5 Proportion of births attended by a physician, midwife or trained auxiliary	♦ Is abortion legal, and if so, are services available in practice?
6 Mortality and length of life, by sex	♦ Have any programmes been introduced to combat AIDS, and have any of these programmes been developed with a focus on women?
7 Maternal mortality rates (per 1,000 live births)	♦ Is intra-household distribution of food biased against women and girls? If so, what are the reasons for this?
8 Infant mortality rates and female/male ratio	♦ Do women spend more on food than men? If so, what are the implications of this?
9 Number and/or incidence of selected communicable diseases of public health importance, including AIDS, by sex	♦ Does access to sanitation and clean water differ by sex? If so, what are the implications of this for women's health?
10 Calorie consumption as a % of minimum requirements, by sex	
11 % of women's/men's incomes spent on food	
12 Access to sanitation and clean water, by sex	

Health, Health Services, Nutrition

Indicators of health are particularly important for the determination of changes in women's status over time. Health indicators should be carefully selected. Indicators on health services and health conditions are weak in most developing countries. Health indicators tend to be found in administrative records and special surveys. The following are key areas where data should be collected (UN, 1990):

- ♦ the state of health of the population;
- ♦ availability and accessibility of resources;
- ♦ use of health resources (hospitals, etc.);
- ♦ environmental data (e.g. related to pollution); and
- ♦ outcomes of preventive and curative measures.

Life expectancy and infant mortality are two indirect health indicators most commonly used for the measurement of the status of women.

Gender-sensitive health indicators do present a number of methodological problems.⁴ Life expectancy at birth, for example, may be problematic because whether or not a person dies in a given year depends on factors over their whole lives and may not reflect present circumstances.

“Whether someone who is 70 years old will survive to 71 or not depends on a large set of factors over the whole of their lives. There is therefore a built-in time-lag, of the order of 35 years, between cause and effect The only way round this problem ... is to take the shortest gap between death and birth, which must be the youngest age group This information is provided by the infant mortality rate, which is defined as the number of deaths under one year of age during a year, per thousand live births during that year.”

Anderson, 1991: 62

The infant mortality rate reflects infants' and mothers' health, environmental health, and general socio-economic development, and is closely related to literacy. However, the infant mortality rate, like all indicators, presents problems. Accurate infant mortality data may not be available; for example, nearly every African country has data on the number of hospital beds, but “hardly have any complete and reliable infant mortality rates” (McGranahan *et al* 1985: 9). Also, the infant mortality rate may be a poor predictor of life expectancy: “With the widespread application in developing countries of health technologies targeted to infants and children ... the link between child mortality and mortality at other ages has been further weakened” (Murray, 1993: 42).

Methodological problems with indicators already discussed mean that gender-sensitive indicators should be used with caution and policy-related conclusions should be drawn from their findings with care.

Economic Activity and Labour Force Participation

It is generally agreed that women's economic activity is under-represented in most censuses and national level surveys, and that the contribution of women to economic development is an area where lack of data is most acute. The following gender-sensitive indicators and indicator questions are designed to allow the user to develop a basic data set on women and economic activity.

Measurement of economic activity and labour force participation is a complex but key area for the advancement of women's status and gender equality and equity.

There are two key areas to be considered in the formation of a national level data base on women. The first is the inclusion of gender-sensitive questions that are fully understood by all participating, including enumerators, in censuses and similar surveys. The second is a reconsideration of the concepts used in the UN System of National Accounts (SNA) as far as work is concerned.

Table 6 Economic Activity and Labour Force Participation

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 % of female/male labour force in agriculture, industry and services (ages 15 and over)	♦ Are there areas where men or women predominantly work? Does sex-stereotyping in employment exist? If so, what are the consequences of this?
2 % of female/male labour force in managerial and professional occupations	♦ What provisions exist to eliminate discrimination against women in employment? How are these provisions enforced?
3 % of female/male labour force who are unpaid family workers or are working in the informal sector (ages 15 and over)	♦ Are women moving to better or worse paid employment? What are the consequences of this for women?
4 Employment/unemployment rate of women/men, urban/rural	♦ Are there professions which, by law or custom, tend to be filled predominantly by or are closed to women?
5 Time use in selected activities (including unpaid housework and child care)	♦ Is there a bias against women in terms of employment because of a lack of child-care facilities?
6 Incidence of part time/full time work of women and men	♦ Do women receive equal pay as men for equal work or work of equal value?
7 Right to maternity leave/number of weeks/% of women who avail of right	♦ What legislation exists to ensure women's equality in terms of employment? How is this legislation enforced in practice?
8 % of available credit and financial and technical support going to women/men from government and non-government sources	♦ Is work done by women in the home counted in national statistics? Do national statistics reflect the role of women in the economic sector? What means are being taken to ensure that censuses and other surveys accurately reflect the economic role of women within and outside of the household?
9 Salary/wage differentials of women/men, by class of workers	
10 % of employers providing child care and % of children aged 0-3 and 3-6 in child care	

Definitions of economic activity

Economic activity is perhaps the most difficult of the concepts used in censuses (see good practices case study on India, Section 5). The generally used term 'economically active population' is problematic because it represents a number of disparate components. The main work-related categories used are:

- ♦ **activity status** (currently active, usually active, and economically active sometime during the year);
- ♦ **employment status** (employed, unemployed, not economically active);
- ♦ **employment characteristics** (occupation, industry, status in employment, and sector of employment);
- ♦ **duration of employment** (hours worked last week, weeks worked last year).

As UN (1993) states, the term 'economically active population' "...combines the employed with the unemployed population; full time with part-time activity; the activity of the worker who is paid for one hour's work in a specified reference period with that of another working full-time throughout the same period; seasonal activities in some instances and current or usual activities in others." However, advances have been made over the last 15 years particularly in the improvement of definitions of terminology related to economic activity.

It has been widely noted that the focus of SNA and ILO definitions of work relate to economic activity. But as Anker *et al* (1988) have pointed out, 'economic activity' is often defined in an unclear or ambiguous fashion. For example, according to the SNA, processing of food for preservation, husking of rice and grinding of grain are considered economic activities, while cooking is not, but the dividing line between these activities is a very thin one. Anker *et al* (1988) point out several similar anomalies, and in response suggest a useful four-part typology to measure labour force activity:

- ◆ paid labour force, that is, persons in wage or salary employment for which they are paid in cash or kind;
- ◆ market-oriented labour force, that is, persons in 'paid labour force' plus persons engaged in an activity on a family farm or in a family enterprise that sells some or all of its products;
- ◆ ILO labour force, that is, persons engaged in the production of economic goods and services, whether these goods and services are sold or not. This includes all activities associated with primary products, such as food production and food processing;
- ◆ extended labour force, including all of the above and activities such as gathering and preparing fuel and water fetching.

This typology is useful in that it extends the definition in the SNA and covers many of the activities carried out by women. Unpaid work such as housework and child-care are not included, and these are discussed next.

Unpaid work and the System of National Accounts

As a tool for economic policy-making, the SNA is a key area where governments can improve the way in which gender-disaggregated data is collected and used.

With a concentration on measuring paid employment, measures such as the SNA and GDP have been heavily criticised for their gender bias, in particular ignoring women's contribution to the economy, and to society as a whole.

There has over the last ten years been extensive methodological debate related to the valuation of unpaid work, in particular in relation to definitions of different kinds of unpaid work and imputation of value (e.g., through replacement or opportunity costs, or both).⁵ Detailed discussion of this debate is beyond the scope of this manual, which focuses on specific gender-sensitive indicators that could be employed in parallel to the SNA.

The 1993 SNA divides unpaid work into three types:

- 1 Housework, child-care and other family-related services (mainly carried out by women), which are not recognised by SNA as economic activity.
- 2 Subsistence and non-market activities such as agricultural production for household consumption (much of which is carried out by women), to be valued in the SNA from 1993 on the basis of market values of similar services that are sold.
- 3 Household enterprises producing for the market for which more than one household member provides unpaid labour. The income and production of these enterprises are quantified in SNA using transaction values.

Much of the recent discussion about unpaid housework, including child-care, caring for dependants and providing voluntary services, has been in relation to developing a parallel or satellite account to the SNA. The World Summit on Social Development in Copenhagen noted: "Efforts are needed to acknowledge the social and economic importance and value of unremunerated work ... including by developing methods for reflecting its value ... in accounts that may be produced separately from, but consistent with core national accounts" (UN, 1995a: para 46). Similar recommendations can be found in the Beijing Platform for Action.

The 1993 SNA gives detailed instructions for the setting up of satellite accounts, which should be developed in the same way as main accounts (Inter-Secretariat Working Group, 1993). However, the sections on satellite accounts in the SNA do not provide examples related to unpaid work, so guidance on this matter has to be sought from other references.

At present several OECD countries, including two Commonwealth countries, Australia and Canada, have developed satellite accounts in relation to unpaid housework. Other countries such as Germany, Norway, Sweden, and Finland are developing national time-use surveys: "Most of these countries have used or will use these data to produce estimates of household work or of total unpaid work, or, as in the case of Germany, to establish a satellite account for the household sector, including household production, or, like Australia, to develop an input-output table for the non-market household sphere" (Chadeau, 1993: 66). At present much of this work is at an early stage and although it has been recognised that there is a need to harmonise approaches to allow international comparison, it has also been recognised that because of methodological disputes and data differences between countries, some flexibility is required (Statistics Canada, 1993).

There is some agreement that the first step in terms of measuring unpaid housework and related aspects of unpaid work is to measure the amount of time spent on these activities. This is the approach taken, for example, in questions on unpaid work in the 1996 Canadian census (see good practices case study, Section 5). Once the time spent on activities is calculated a value can be given to this time. Time-use studies are thus particularly important for this area of the development of gender-sensitive indicators.

There is also some consensus as to what is to be included as important unpaid work, even if not as to how to estimate its value. The key areas are:

- ♦ domestic work, including meal preparation, cleaning up after food or meal preparation; cleaning inside and outside the house; clothing care, including laundry, ironing and clothes and shoe repair; and repairs and maintenance, including home repairs, gardening and grounds maintenance;
- ♦ help and child-care, including physical care of children, education and medical care of children; and adult-care, including personal and medical care;
- ♦ management and shopping including household administration and shopping for goods and services;
- ♦ transportation and travel;
- ♦ volunteer work, including fundraising, attending meetings and research; and
- ♦ unpaid work in the labour force.

Specific indicators, as illustrative examples related to domestic work that could be included in national time-use studies, are as follows. An example of a straightforward question would be (taken from 1996 Canadian census): "Number of hours per week spent by household members doing unpaid housework, yard work or home maintenance for members of this household, or others". Alternatively, this question could be asked in the following way (Statistics Canada, 1993: 117, reporting on a study in the US):

"Now let's talk about housework, including cooking and cleaning and doing other work around the house:

- 1 Do you prepare food for meals or wash dishes?*
- 2 Do you do grocery shopping?*
- 3 Do you clean and vacuum?*
- 4 Do you do laundry?*
- 5 Do you sew and mend?*

Altogether, about how many hours do you spend doing these things in an average week?"

Similar lines of enquiry could be pursued for the other areas of unpaid work noted above, with all data being sex-disaggregated to determine women and men's contributions. The next stage, about which there is still methodological disagreement, would be to place a value on each of these areas of unpaid work so that the satellite national account could be developed.

As discussion on the valuation and importance of unpaid work becomes more sophisticated, the development of satellite accounts related to unpaid work through time-use and other studies offers an opportunity for governments to make significant progress on the development of a national level database of gender-sensitive indicators. However, "very few time-use surveys have been conducted at the national level in developing countries" (Harvey, 1993). So the first step in this area for governments who have not yet done so would be to design national level time-use studies concentrating on unpaid work and to experiment with different forms of imputation of value for this work. INSTRAW has been co-ordinating a number of studies in this area in developing countries, including Tanzania (Harvey, 1993).

Access to Land, Equipment and Credit

Women's land ownership rights differ from country to country, but it is clear that generally land is under male ownership and control. There has been little systematic focus on the question on women's access to and control over land, despite the potential importance of land to the improvement of women's status and gender equity (Agarwal, 1994). Agarwal notes that while in law women have the right to own land in South Asia, in practice women's ownership and control is rare (1994: 468). Key questions in this area therefore include whether legislation exists at the country level that ensures gender equality in both access to and control over land.

The World Conference on Agrarian Reform and Rural Development (WCARRD), which requires member countries of the FAO to report on various aspects of agrarian development (see Section 4), has suggested indicators for access to land, water and other natural resources (Dey-Abbas and Gaiha, 1993: 250-1).

In addition, States Parties of CEDAW are required to report on Article 14 on discrimination against rural women, Section (g) of which states that women have the right: "to have access to agricultural credit and loans, marketing facilities, appropriate technology and equal treatment in land and agrarian reform as well as in land resettlement schemes".

Some gender-sensitive indicators may be available from agricultural censuses, or such censuses could be adapted to ensure that gender-sensitive indicators are available from this source.

An important differentiation between indicators of access and control over rural resources occurs in the case of credit. In one of the best known cases of women's access to credit, the Grameen Bank in Bangladesh, there is evidence that while loans are made to and have to be repaid by women, it may be men who made key decisions over how the loan is used (Goetz and Sen Gupta, 1996). This highlights the importance of using indicators in combination with qualitative analysis such as gender analysis or related questions such as those given in the tables in this section. To stop at the level of use of gender-sensitive indicators in this case would have shown greater gender equality, but analysis of intra-household decision making may have revealed a more complex pattern of gender discrimination.

Table 7 Access to Land, Equipment and Credit

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 % of property owned or accessible by women (land, houses, livestock), across income groups	♦ Is land mainly under the control of men or women? What are the consequences of this for gender relations, decisions about land sales and cropping patterns?
2 % of women who have access to credit, vis-à-vis men	♦ What are the inheritance practices in the country concerning land? If women can legally inherit land, do they do this in practice?
3 % of rural households where female/male head is the main household earner	♦ If women own land does this also mean that they make decisions concerning crop selection and marketing?
4 % of female/male headed households without land	♦ Has land reform benefited men and women equally?
5 % average wage rates for agricultural labourers, by sex	♦ Do women have equal access to credit facilities: Does such access translate into control over credit in terms of decision-making?
6 % of women/men who have received land titles under land reform schemes	♦ Is there a difference between women and men's agricultural labour wages?

Legal Rights and Political Power⁶

There has been increasing focus on women's legal rights and political power over the last ten years, a focus that work on indicators is only beginning to reflect. However, a number of indicators can be extrapolated from the literature related to this area. For example the UNDP Gender Empowerment Matrix employs as one of its indicators the commonly used "share of parliamentary seats going to women and men". *The World's Women* (UN, 1995a) uses as indicators: "Countries where more than 15% of ministers or subministers are women", "% of women in decision-making positions in government by field", and "women in broadcasting and the press". A number of similar indicators could be employed, dependent on data availability, but again with the caveat that indicators will only paint the broad picture of women's and men's participation.

Indicators of empowerment and participation in CEDAW reporting

This section focuses on the reporting requirements of states parties as far as developing a national database on gender-sensitive indicators is concerned, with particular focus on indicators of participation and empowerment. A more comprehensive discussion of CEDAW, including discussion of reporting to the Committee, non-signatories, reservations of states parties and impact of the Convention, can be found in Commonwealth Secretariat (1996), and CEDAW (1995a and 1995b).

Reporting requirements under CEDAW often result in the first comprehensive review of the situation of women in a particular country (CEDAW, 1995). But CEDAW is also a key convention in relation to gender-sensitive indicators because it requires reporting on cultural, legal and political areas which are not covered in any of the standard mechanisms from which gender-sensitive indicators can be taken, for example censuses. These areas are:

- ♦ sex roles and stereotyping (Article 5);
- ♦ suppression of the exploitation of women (Article 6);
- ♦ political and public life (Article 7);
- ♦ international representation and participation (Article 8);
- ♦ equality before the law and in civil matters (Article 15);
- ♦ equality in marriage and family law (Article 16).

Table 8 **Political and Public Life**

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 % of seats held by women and men in national parliaments and local government/decision-making bodies	♦ What are the obstacles that prevent women from gaining decision-making positions in government or the civil service?
2 % of women and men in decision-making positions in government	♦ What are the obstacles that prevent women from gaining decision-making positions in the judicial system and the police force?
3 % of women and men electoral candidates/officers in political parties	♦ Do courts or other tribunals promote and protect the rights of women?
4 % of women in the civil service, at four highest levels of office	♦ Is one socio-economic group dominant as far as holding decision-making positions is concerned?
5 % of women employed in the public sector, at administrative and managerial levels	♦ How many cases of gender discrimination were brought before the courts or other government bodies in the last four years? How were they decided?
6 % of women/men registered as voters/% of eligible women/men who vote	♦ What input do women make to changes in the political system?
7 % of women in senior/junior decision-making positions within unions	
8 % of women judges, justices and prosecutors	
9 % of women in the police force, by rank	

In addition, General Recommendations 12 and 14 of CEDAW require states parties to include information relating to all forms of violence against women, including female circumcision. As such the Convention reflects recent changes in understanding as to the means by which to progress towards gender equality, and in particular a focus on women's rights (CEDAW, 1995b). CEDAW requires not only the listing of laws related to gender equality but also statistical reporting on the effects of implementation of these laws.

However, the reports of states parties are often weak in areas relating to women's rights, empowerment and participation. While the reports may contain extensive documentation and indicators relating to health and education, the sections relating to, for example, Articles 5 and 7 are often quite short.

Overall, CEDAW is an excellent mechanism for collecting gender-sensitive data in areas such as empowerment, participation and violence not covered in many other national level surveys. Such data will need to be generated from specially commissioned surveys.

Violence against Women

As with political power, there has also been increasing attention paid in the last ten years to violence against women. Discussion of violence against women is also included in the focus on women's rights as human rights (Amnesty International, 1995). *The World's Women* notes:

“Currently the only quantitative data that most governments collect on violence against women are reported crime statistics on rape, assault and various other sexual crimes. These have serious limitations and should be complemented with data from other sources. Questions related to intimate assault and rape can be added to population-based surveys... or crime victimisation surveys ... Experience has shown that disclosure of violence is greatly influenced by the content of the questions, (and) the context of the questioning ... questions and questionnaires must be carefully planned and interviewers carefully selected and trained to ask direct questions about violence.”

UN, 1995a: 164

The World's Women (UN 1995a) uses, among others, as key indicators:

- ♦ % of adult women who have been physically assaulted by an intimate partner;
- ♦ % of women in selected large cities who were sexually assaulted in a five-year period;
- ♦ numbers of NGOs working on violence against women;
- ♦ rape reform laws passed;
- ♦ domestic violence reforms passed;
- ♦ government body responsible for anti-violence programming.

Table 9 Indicators of Gender-Related Violence

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 Number of reported cases of domestic violence	♦ Has the country followed CEDAW recommendations and reported on laws enacted to protect women from violence?
2 Number of reported cases of sexual assault and rape	♦ How effective is legislation banning different forms of violence against women?
3 Number of reported cases of sexual harassment	♦ Are the representations of women in the media, in advertising or in school curricula likely to lead to violence against women?
4 Conviction rates of accused violent offenders against women	♦ In what ways have women organised to combat violence? What has been the result of this organisation?
5 Number of immediate protective measures taken to assist abused women (legal aid, financial assistance, housing assistance, shelters, police action, NGO efforts)	♦ Does the country enforce the UN Convention prohibiting the slave trade and exploitation through prostitution? What measures does the country have to address the commercial sexual exploitation of the girl-child?
6 Increase/decrease of violence against women during armed conflict	♦ Are women refugees protected during periods of armed conflict?

Table 9 contains indicators that could be used for the development of gender-sensitive indicators at the national level in the key area of violence against women. These indicators will need to be generated through the use of specially commissioned surveys.

Macroeconomic Policy and Gender

The final priority area to be covered here is macro-economic policy and gender. Integrating gender into national budgetary processes has become an important focus for many countries. This can be done in particular by examining national budgets for

gender-sensitivity and estimating budgetary expenditure going towards priority areas as they affect women and men.

The Commonwealth Secretariat is developing a series of policy options for integrating gender into national budgetary policies in the context of economic reform. The policy options centre on six possible tools :

- ♦ **sex-disaggregated beneficiary assessments** – a research technique whereby groups of women are asked how, if they were the Finance Minister, they would slice the national budgetary pie; the results are compared with the existing budget to see how closely it reflects women's priorities;
- ♦ **sex-disaggregated public expenditure incidence analysis** – this involves analysing public expenditures in such areas as health, education and agriculture to see how such expenditures benefit women and men, girls and boys to differing degrees;
- ♦ **gender-aware policy evaluation of public expenditure** – evaluating the policy assumptions that underlie budgetary appropriations, to identify their likely impact on current patterns and degrees of gender differences;
- ♦ **gender-aware budget statement** – a modification of the Women's Budget; this is a statement from each sectoral ministry or line department on the gender implications of the budget within that sector;
- ♦ **sex-disaggregated analysis of the impact of the budget on time-use** – this looks at the relationship between the national budget and the way time is used in households, so as to reveal the macroeconomic implications of unpaid work such as caring for the family, the sick and community members, collecting fuel and water, cooking, cleaning, teaching children and so on;
- ♦ **gender-aware medium-term economic policy framework** – medium-term macroeconomic policy frameworks are currently formulated using a variety of economy-wide models which are usually 'gender-blind'. Approaches for integrating gender could include: disaggregating variables by gender where applicable; introducing new variables incorporating a gender perspective; constructing new models that incorporate both national income accounts and household income accounts reflecting unpaid work; and changing underlying assumptions about the social and institutional set-up for economic planning.

At present, indicators in the area of national level budgeting are patchy and usually not internationally comparable. The indicators given in Table 10 are therefore illustrative of key areas where governments should refine budgetary planning to ensure that gender-sensitive data is available. Some areas of national level budgetary expenditure have already been covered in Tables 4 and 5, and other relevant discussion of national level accounts and labour force activity can be found in the discussion of the System of National Accounts in Section 3. Further details of related indicators can be found in the Appendix, Section F.

Table 10 Macroeconomic Policy and Gender

Gender-Sensitive Indicator	Related Indicator Questions
1 Private consumption expenditure of households	♦ How much of the household's expenditure is directed towards the purchase of food, and education and health related matters?
2 Total government expenditure and as percentage of GDP	Who controls the household budget, and what say do women have in expenditure?
3 Breakdown of government expenditure by sector	♦ How far is government expenditure directed towards priority areas for women such as education and health? What role do women have in national level budgetary planning?
4 Proportion of persons and households at risk covered by social security and similar schemes	♦ Are health and education systems privatised and if so, what are the gender implications of this?
5 Proportion of potentially eligible persons and households receiving social insurance, social assistance and similar benefits	♦ Are women adequately covered by social security and other schemes? Are such schemes sufficiently gender-sensitive? Is sufficient attention being paid during national level budgetary planning to groups at risk, such as poor single mothers and female-headed households?

Notes

- Sections 3.1-3.3 are drawn from UN (1990a; 1989).
- The crude birth rate is obtained by dividing the average number of women of childbearing age in the population in one year, by the number of live births occurring during the same period.
- The following section is adapted from CIDA (1996a; 1996b) and UN (1990a).
- The following section is adapted from CIDA (1996a; 1996b) and UN (1990a).
- Much of this debate is summarised in Statistics Canada (1995a; 1993) and Goldschmidt-Clermont (1987).
- This and the following section draw on CIDA (1996a; 1996b).